

THE RESTORATION CHURCHES IN TORONTO

A paper presented on the occasion of

The annual meeting of

The Canadian Churches of Christ Historical Society

Saturday, August 28, 2004

At the Strathmore Blvd. Church of Christ

by

Geoffrey H. Ellis

THE RESTORATION CHURCHES IN TORONTO

Restoration as a movement is two directional. It moves away from the departures that mark traditional Christianity. And it moves toward reproducing the faith and practice of Biblical Christianity. Restoration's two-fold goal is simple but challenging: to learn the will of God and to do it. The work of Restoration is to achieve widespread agreement on its findings so that Christian unity might prevail. Clarity of position and vigorous growth are features of a successful Restoration movement. The history of the Restoration movement in Toronto, filled with hopefulness, sincere effort, struggle and disappointment, illustrates how difficult it is to achieve success in bringing to the fore "the ancient order."

In 1821 in Upper Canada are detected the first glimmerings of Restoration. In that year James Black, recently arrived from Argyle, Scotland, a Presbyterian-turned-Baptist began teaching reform doctrine in Aldborough Township, on the north shore of Lake Erie. Black, moving to Eramosa Township in 1830, would spend his 65 years in Canada promoting the Restoration, with the nearby developing congregation at Everton becoming a fountainhead for the Restoration in Canada. In 1821 David Oliphant Sr arrived from Scotland, bearing his newborn son, David Jr who held such great promise for the cause as Canada's premiere editor. Oliphant Sr visited briefly John Menzies and a small company, Scotch Baptists it is thought, who had applied the previous year for permission to begin both a pioneer settlement and a pioneer church in Esquesing Township, northwest of Toronto. The little church at Norval became a rich source of reform influence until its demise in the mid-1870s. David Jr served faithfully from 1845 until his death in 1885. Again, in 1821, after repeated letters from Mary Stodgill pleading for ministerial assistance, three preachers of the "Christian Connection" arrived in the Newmarket area. From this advancing movement came Joseph Ash and others who led the reform along the north shore of Lake Ontario, east of Toronto. Soon the fires of Restoration were burning across the province.

Meanwhile in 1821, in "muddy" York (renamed Toronto in 1834¹), a community of just 500 at that time, a 23-year old young man named James Beaty was just beginning his outstanding career as a Torontonian.² He had arrived in York from Ireland on March

¹ "Beaty was among the most active of those who agitated for the City Charter of 1834..." "The Descendants of Robert Beaty and Catherine Crawford," (genealogy, updated 2001 by Dave Hunter and Garry Robertson); available from <http://www.islandregister.com/beaty.html>; Internet; accessed August 24 2004.

² James Beaty (1798-1892) was an independent thinker, a vigorous worker, and a natural leader who became prominent in politics, business, and newspaper publication until his retirement in 1877. He died in 1892. Joseph A. C. Robertson, in a 1937 genealogy writes: "Probably the history of no single individual is more closely linked with the varied phases of the city's progress than that of Mr. James Beaty, Sr, ex-M.P. He was identified with every work calculated to advance the material interests of his adopted city. As a journalist he won provincial reputation..." Beaty himself, reflecting upon his life, commented, "After 1837 I had something to do with nearly every movement in the city." The list of his accomplishments and endeavors is extensive: In politics he was Councilman for St. Lawrence Ward in 1836, an Alderman in St. Lawrence Ward in 1846-40, an Alderman in St. David's Ward in 1853, a candidate for the Legislative Council in 1856 (defeated by Paton), an elected member to Canada's first Federal Parliament in 1867 for East Toronto, re-elected in 1872, retiring from politics in 1873. In business he was President of the Toronto Roads Co., President of the Building Society, Director of The People's Bank, Western Assurance Co., Grand Trunk Railroad, and the Northern Railway. Included in his business activities was house construction, building all told some 57 houses. In philanthropy, he was a founding trustee of Toronto

17, 1818 by way of New York (1817), spending his first night in Jordan's historic York Hotel.³ In 1822, on Dec. 26, he married Sarah Ann Armstrong, the sister of William Armstrong,⁴ his co-worker in shoe making and leather working. James' older brother, John, a pioneer farmer at Omagh stood as his witness. To this union were born two children, Mary Ann in 1824 and William in 1827. With the arrival of her second child, Sarah Ann took her children to a clergyman for baptism. He required that the father also be present. James refused to have his children baptized. When the clergyman accused James of being in bad company, he replied, "If I have, it was with Christ and his apostles." Sarah Ann Beaty passed away in 1829 and Beaty never remarried.⁵

Raised in the English Church in Cavan County, Ireland, an early negative experience with the clergy⁶ prompted Beaty's growing dislike for the clergy system and the Established Church arrangement.⁷ His personal study of the Scriptures led him to conclude that being a New Testament Christian was all that was required. He shared his views publicly and "was first joined by a young man named John Bennett, a hatter, who had been impressed by views announced by Mr. Beaty at a meeting in a Presbyterian church on Duchess Street. They were soon joined by a man named Shanklin."⁸ It is said that Shanklin and Beaty baptized each other in the Toronto Harbour.⁹ A circle of

General Hospital, Potters Field, the Mechanics Institute, and the House of Industry, and Commissioner of the Lunatic Asylum. In newspaper publication, he founded the *Leader* in 1852 and published it for 25 years; he also began the *Patriot* and later merged it with the *Leader*; he also purchased the *Orange Organ* and the *Colonist* and discontinued the latter. An Irish Protestant, he was a loyal Orangeman, and marched in the first Orange parade in Toronto in 1820, "one of twelve." Significantly, the Orange banners read, "The Bible, the whole Bible, and nothing but the Bible." Descendents of Robert Beaty.

³ Beaty's recollections: "I visited Kingston first...At Kingston I heard a great deal about Muddy York and made up my mind to visit it...It was in the month of March...when I reached York there was four feet of snow on the ground. We put up at a hotel kept by a man named Jordan, near where the market now is. The Parliament of Upper Canada was sitting in an upper room of the inn at the time...Toronto was then a little village hemmed in on three sides by woods." Ibid. The York Hotel, on the south side of King St. between Princess and Berkeley Streets was the temporary home of the parliament after the Americans had burned down the parliament building in 1813 in the War of 1812-14. The hotel was the largest of a half dozen taverns in the town. Bruce Smith, *Toronto* (Toronto: Doubleday Canada Limited, 1979), 73.

⁴ The Armstrong clan was from the Scottish Lowlands. Armstrongs also migrated to Ireland. William Armstrong, therefore, could have been a Scottish Presbyterian. Or, as one associating with the Irishman, James Beaty, he might have been a Scots-Irish person also of the Anglican faith, as Beaty was originally.

⁵ "Beginning of the Church of Christ in Toronto," a hand-written note of Mabel McCartney, quoted by Steve May, "The Church of Christ at Omagh: a Restoration Miniature," *The Campbell-Stone Movement in Ontario*, ed. Claude E. Cox (Queenston, ON: The Edwin Mellen Press, 1995), 251-263.

⁶ "His early experience in Ireland with the State established church was not very pleasant. His personal observations on seeing the widow's only cow taken for the tithes never got out of his indignant mind." Descendents of Robert Beaty.

⁷ "His opposition to the clergy reserves, which were laid apart in Canada for four sects by an English king, was chiefly based on his religious convictions that such national provisions for any clergy or sects were antagonistic to the principles of civil and religious liberty and directly contrary to the Christian Scriptures...He entered upon his active political career by uniting with Dr. Baldwin and Hume Blake to oppose the Clergy Reserves and the family compact land reservations." Ibid.

⁸ Ibid. This slim evidence of some association with the Presbyterian Church may suggest that Sarah Ann's clergyman was Presbyterian.

⁹ Reuben Butchart, *The Disciples of Christ in Canada Since 1830* (Toronto: Canadian Headquarters' Publications, Churches of Christ (Disciples) 1949), 502. Butchart cites a report in the *Mail and Empire*, Toronto, March 6, 1892, that suggests that Beaty's baptism took place approximately in "the years 1820-5, or certainly before 1828." It would seem reasonable that Beaty's baptism took place around the time of his children's birth. Cf. Alexander Campbell's experience of having his mind focused upon the subject when

fellowship developed that included James Armstrong,¹⁰ a saddler; Alexander Stewart,¹¹ said to be the first Baptist preacher in Toronto; William McMaster,¹² a dry-goods wholesaler; Joseph Lesslie, who would become postmaster for the city; his brother James, who would become publisher of *The Examiner*;¹³ Peter Rutherford, and Neil C. Love. At some point they began meeting regularly in the home of James Armstrong at 104 Yonge Street.¹⁴ While described by some as a “Scotch Baptist” church, it would be more accurate to designate this group simply as an “independent fellowship.”¹⁵ In the mid-1830s, differences¹⁶ within the group resulted in the withdrawal of several to the Regular Baptist church in the city, e.g. Alexander Stewart and William McMaster.¹⁷ The Beaty group, consisting of 14 to 16 persons, “organized” in 1838. In 1841, they moved to

the question of his children’s baptism arose. His study led him personally to accept adult immersion. That Sarah Ann was acting in accordance with Church of England practice (or possibly the infant baptism practice of the Presbyterian church) in seeking her children’s baptism and on her own initiative would indicate some difference between her and her husband. That she waited until after the birth of her second child to act, may point to the conflict existing at the time of her first child’s birth. Thus, Beaty may have accepted baptism around 1823.

¹⁰ An obituary for the widow of James Armstrong who died Oct. 30, 1853, indicated that she “was for the last 24 years united with the Disciples” [i.e. 1829]. *Banner of the Faith*, VIII, 2 (Feb. 1854), 53. Also, their daughter, Mrs. T. C. Stephens remembered conversing with James Beaty on religious subjects, “which places the date before 1828.” Descendants. This would suggest that people were being taught and received into fellowship with this early group in at least 1828-29.

¹¹ Joseph Ash describes an Alexander Stewart as having association with the Eramosa fellowship around 1830. He incorrectly identifies this group as being “Scotch Baptist,” whereas in fact James Black, the leader, was a Baptist of the English order. Butchart identifies an Alexander Stewart associated with the group at Esquesing and describes him as “Scotch Baptist,” whereas the evidence is that he was also of the English Baptist variety although no doubt a Scotsman. Thomas Fountain observed that Alexander Stewart was “perhaps the first Baptist preacher in Toronto.” Thomas Fountain, “Toronto’s Early Disciples,” *The Campbell-Stone Movement*, 214. It is likely that this is the same “Alexander Stewart” identified in all three locations. His removal to the Regular Baptists when the Toronto group divided would indicate his doctrinal position. In a valuable reflection on the Reformation in Ontario, given near the end of his life, James Black gives the names of the early preachers “well-known among us” and listed both Alexander Stewart and John Menzies as being “in Esquesing and Little York (now Toronto)” and went on to identify that five of those listed “went through a course of study training for Gospel-preaching.” Included are “Alexander Stewart in Edinburgh and Dugald Sinclair...in Bradford.” Now Bradford was, early in the 19th century, a Baptist college in England. In Edinburgh was the university that English Baptists happily attended, as Englishmen not of the Anglican faith could not attend Oxford or Cambridge. The presence of the English Baptists studying at Edinburgh was the means by which the Baptist faith entered Scotland. The first Scot to accept their doctrine and ministerial method was Christopher Anderson in about 1800. The Baptist, James Lister, baptized Dugald Sinclair in 1801, and Sinclair in 1806 went to study at Bradford. The likelihood is that it was as a Baptist that Alexander Stewart studied at Edinburgh. Cf. James Black, *Christian Worker*, August 1885, 3; cited by Butchart, 63.

¹² McMaster (1811-1887), also from Ireland, County Tyrone, arrived in Toronto in 1833 via New York. He joined George Brown’s Reformers, opposed the Church of England, and was pro-Baptist. He played a major role in establishing the Canadian Bank of Commerce and became its president. Later in life he supported the Canadian Literary Institute, a Baptist institution in Woodstock established in 1857 and the Toronto Baptist College established in 1881. These merged in 1887 and with the endowment of nearly a million dollars from McMaster opened in 1890 in Toronto as McMaster University (moving to Hamilton in 1930). C.M. Johnston, “McMaster, William,” “McMaster University,” *The Canadian Encyclopedia* (Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers, 1988), 1278.

¹³ Edward Lesslie (1764-18280 and family including his sons, James and Joseph, came to Canada around 1822 from Dundee, Scotland. There is evidence that he held reform convictions. James (1802-1885) opened a store in Kingston. Edward and the rest of the family moved to York and opened a store. Edward went into partnership with William Lyon Mackenzie, who also had come from Dundee, in 1820, in a store on King

meet in a hall made available by James Beaty when he joined two of his cottages on his property at the corner of Shuter and Victoria streets.¹⁸ This was replaced by a brick building also provided, it is believed, by Beaty in 1863, located at 22 Shuter Street.¹⁹ In 1842, Thomas C. Scott, having committed to a reform position in Scotland, arrived in Toronto and joined with the Beaty group.²⁰ In 1843, a gathering of Disciples at Norval for the purpose of organizing for regional evangelism was reported by James Menzies to Campbell's *Millennial Harbinger* in which sixteen congregations were listed as having delegates or representation by letter. Included was mention made of the group in "Toronto (city)" that numbered 33. The Toronto congregation is the only one mentioned

St. one block west of Frederick, in one of the first brick buildings in Toronto. James moved to York in 1826 and took over the store. Both Mackenzie and Lesslie Sr went into politics, ran for positions of alderman and won. In 1834 when York became Toronto and five wards were formed, Mackenzie was elected mayor, and Lesslie was his right hand man for a year. James Lesslie was also active as a radical reformer. Both James and Joseph participated in the reformers' push for a change in the province political structure, but did not participate in the 1837 Rebellion. That the Lesslies were clearly liberals and Beaty a strong conservative provides an insight into the tensions that resulted with the Lesslies withdrawing from the congregation in which Beaty was the dominant influence, in the formation of the Richmond St. church in association with T. C. Scott.

¹⁴ Later the home of the British and Foreign Bible Society. Butchart, 502.

¹⁵ Joseph Ash in his *Reminiscences* identifies this as a "Scotch Baptist" church in Toronto (1820-1833) (*Christian Worker*, July 1883). Butchart also agrees that this early group was likely a "Scotch Baptist" church (p. 505). Although the subsequent practices and attitudes of the Beaty congregation may have been similar to those characteristically associated with the Scotch Baptists, the early group was composed in the main of reformed Irish-Anglicans and Baptists of the English persuasion.

¹⁶ These were tumultuous times in the province and in the city. Discontent would lead to the 1837 Rebellions. McMaster supported the Liberal, George Brown. While Beaty was an "Orange Tory" and, while sympathetic to the plight of the common people and their complaints against the Family Compact, after the Rebellion—when he came close to being shot for his support of their cause, yet opposing their proposed violence—he remained a Conservative in politics for the remainder of his life. It is unlikely that these strong-minded men could avoid political tensions within the church fellowship.

¹⁷ The withdrawal may have been the other way around, i.e. Beaty and those faithful to his position doing the withdrawing. In this case the early group would best be described as an independent Baptist fellowship, perhaps similar to the "Republican Baptists" that followed Alexander Campbell in the 1820s. The reasons for the separation are given variously: according to Ash, because of "Calvinism" (Butchart, p. 502); and according to McMaster, because Beaty did not believe in "an educated ministry" (Charles M. Johnston, *McMaster University, Vol 1/The Toronto Years* (Toronto: University of Toronto, 1976), 21; cited by Thomas Fountain, 215). In the former, because those who disassociated from the Beaty position went to the Regular Baptists, not the Particular, or Calvinistic, Baptists, there is some question as to Ash's conclusion. In the latter, "an educated ministry" is a euphemism for "the educated, ordained pastor," i.e. the clergy that Beaty so strongly rejected. The latter seems closer to the facts.

¹⁸ J. Ross Robertson, *Landmarks of Toronto*, 1904, cited by Butchart, 501.

¹⁹ David Oliphant Jr's description: "A new meeting house [on Shuter Street] deserves passing notice... Of the thirty or forty structures called churches, but more correctly styled chapels, in the city of Toronto, we are not acquainted with any one so simple, so suitable, so serviceable in its proportions and furnishings as the edifice in Shuter (sic) street. It is constructed of the most tasty brick; is between sixty and seventy feet in length; nearly forty feet wide; proportionate height; plain neat seats; no pulpit—not even the sign of a clerical 'sacred desk'; but a convenient stand for bible, hymnbook, and candlestick; a christian laver for the emblematic burial and resurrection of Jesus; and one or two convenient rooms for sundry purposes. It is reported, but we know not the truth of the report, that it was built with means once possessed by a benevolent sister. It is also stated as a reliable rumor that it was erected by the liberal contribution of an enterprising brother. This however is an item by itself, which may be 'hid from the wise and prudent, and revealed to babes.'" *Banner of the Faith*, XVII, 3-4 (Mar.-Apr. 1863), 61-62.

for which a date of beginning was not available.²¹ In 1847 there were 21,050 citizens in Toronto.

As significant as these beginnings in Toronto are, it is necessary to make several observations. In twenty years the Toronto effort had grown to about 33 members; it had experienced one separation. In the same period some twenty-four congregations of the Restoration order, including Shuter Street, had been established around the province with a combined membership of approximately 500. No general leadership is noted as emanating from Toronto in advancing this regional outreach.²² This writer knows of no extant teaching from the pen of James Beaty on religious matters.²³ Thus it is difficult to identify his beliefs and their development except through the circumstances of the Shuter Street church viewed in retrospect through later commentary. We do not know when he learned of the teachings of Campbell and Stone, or when he and his group identified as “Disciples.”²⁴ David Oliphant Jr began his publishing work with *Witness of Truth* in 1845. From that time on, an almost unbroken silence prevails with respect to reports regarding the Toronto work at Shuter St., even on into the early 1860s.²⁵ Oliphant, who was eager to report the activities of the churches in his publications, in response to the frequent question, “How are the Disciples prospering in the city of Toronto?” stated, “... one uniform reply is given. There is not before us sufficient evidence to determine

²⁰ Thomas Chalmers Scott (1806-1876) was born near Dundee, Scotland. As a young man, he studied with a small group of his peers, with the result that he left the Presbyterian Church, joined the Independents, then determined to be baptized. He along with a dozen others formed a church. In 1827 or 28 he married Anne Galloway. He migrated with his family including three children to New York, intending to settle in the western states. Meeting James Lesslie in New York, with whom he had mutual friends in Dundee, and who offered him a position, he was persuaded to come to Toronto where he at once joined the Disciples and became one of the leaders of this group. In 1849 he was appointed chief clerk in the Custom House and in December of the same year he became the Surveyor of Customs for the Port of Toronto, a position held until his death. His wife died in 1854. In 1856 he married Sarah Hawley, of Detroit. Hugh McDiarmid, Obituary, Thomas Chalmers Scott, *Bible Index*, 2nd series, I, 1 (Jan. 1877), 18-22.

²¹ *Millennial Harbinger*, August 1843, 346.

²² James Beaty is credited with encouraging a small group in Cooksville that began in 1840; contributing to the establishment of the church in Omagh in 1845; (the Omagh building of 1851 was built on land donated by James Beaty, according to Beaty’s design, and fitted with doors, windows, and pews from Toronto supplied by Beaty); and later at Postville, Trafalgar township in 1861.

²³ Beaty is quoted once in print, in 1883 relative to the closing of the Shuter St. building. *Bible Index*, II, 12 (Dec. 1874), 359-360; and in 1889 with respect to the opening of the Spadina Ave. church, his letter to the *Globe* is quoted in the *Bible Index*, XVIII, 193 (Nov. 1889), 351.

²⁴ Campbell’s *Christian Baptist* and *Millennial Harbinger* (beginning in 1830) were known to the Christian Connection in Ontario. Joseph Ash in Cobourg began reading these in 1830. David Oliphant Sr and James Black in Eramosa were reading the *Millennial Harbinger* in 1833. It is reasonable to assume that Beaty would have become aware of these writings and the principles they espoused fairly early in the 1830s. Among those meeting at Cooksville, perhaps as early as 1840, a group assisted by Beaty, there was a brother Ross who had been baptized by Alexander Campbell in Richmond, VA. (Butchart, 419.

²⁵ “Shuter Street, Toronto” is listed as one of the churches contributing to Wellington County Co-operation in its March-April report, 1861, i.e. \$10.20, in the pages of the *Banner of the Faith*, (XV, 2, 1861, 76, 77). And \$10.00 from an individual from Shuter Street is also listed in the 1864 report. *Message of Good-Will to Men*, XVIII, 3-4 (Mar.-Apr. 1864), 56. Eugene Perry surveyed the *Witness of Truth* (1845-1850) and the *Christian Mirror* (1851) and found no reference either to James Beaty or Shuter St. T. C. Scott and/or Richmond St. were mentioned about a dozen times in these papers. A. Anderson, traveling evangelist for some thirty years in Ontario, stated in 1873, “Till our present visit [Shuter St.] we were only partially acquainted with these brethren.” *Bible Index*, 7, 1 (May 1873), 102.

whether the disciples prosper or do not prosper as the elect of God in the city of Toronto...”²⁶

The second congregation to gather in Toronto came as the result of a separation rather than as a positive church planting. At some point, possibly 1846,²⁷ a group of brethren withdrew from the Shuter Street congregation to begin meeting on Richmond Street.²⁸ Leading the departure was Thomas Scott. Also separating were the Lesslie brothers and Peter Rutherford. The impression is left that there was not room for two strong-minded men in the Shuter Street church and that the Richmond Street group was the more “progressive” of the two.²⁹ In the early days, fellowship was not completely cut off between these two groups,³⁰ and the disagreements were such that reconciliation was desirable. Oliphant, on a visit to Toronto in 1863, felt a responsibility to make an effort to heal, as far as within our power, a *long standing* [italics mine] alienation, issuing in separate religious interests, among certain excellent men in the city. Some two or three initiatory steps were taken, which, so far, were successful; but on account of the very serious illness of brother T. C. Scott, a truly humble learner of the Chief Master, it seemed both prudent and necessary to postpone further action.³¹

Some additional steps were taken during the summer: “...when through pressure brought by members of other churches which were friendly with both bodies a union was brought about.”³² Oliphant returns to this issue a year later and speaks concerning the “...the movement of July last, the period of the union of the two bodies long separated, which gave promise of a happy result” and concludes, “If we live until July 1864, one year from the date of their avowed union, perchance another careful look at the brethren in the city may be taken, and progress reported.”³³ However, the differences, which had formerly

²⁶ Ibid., 61.

²⁷ 1846-47 is given for the beginning of this group by Ross Robertson (*Landmarks*, vol. 3, 305). Butchart declares that Richmond St. was “well established” in 1850 (505). The one “preacher” for Toronto David Oliphant identifies in his expansive 1857 New Year’s greeting is “brother Scott.” *The Christian Banner*, XI, 1 (Jan. 1857), 5.

²⁸ Robertson gives the place of meeting on Richmond St. as west of Yonge, giving the date 1846-47 (vol. 3, 205; cited by Fountain, 215). Whereas, Butchart places it on the south side just east of Victoria St. (505). Following a visit to Toronto by Isaac Errett, his report of his visit to the Richmond St. congregation appeared in the *Bible Index*: “Bro. Scott presides over a little congregation that selected a new location for church activity some 8 or 9 years ago [1864 or 1865].” This would be the Temperance Hall on Richmond St. mentioned by H. McDiarmid in his obituary for Scott. Hugh McDiarmid, Obituary for T. C. Scott, *Bible Index*, 2nd series, I, I, (Jan. 1877), 18-22.

²⁹ H. McDiarmid: “After a while” because of “radical differences...regarding matters of faith and otherwise...of whom Mr. James Beatty (sic) Senior was the most prominent” a secession of about one-third the membership occurred.” Obituary.

³⁰ Alexander Campbell, in his 1855 visit to Ontario, stayed with the T. C. Scott family Aug. 13-15, on his return trip from Bowmanville on his way to London. Campbell wrote of his impressions regarding the Toronto situation in the August issue of the *Millennial Harbinger*: “...our brethren are not as prosperous [I take that to mean religiously] and co-operative as they might be, or as they should be, and, as we hope they will be. They have talents, learning, and the means of being eminently useful, provided only, that mere order, or mere discipline, or church etiquette, should not usurp the place of province of faith, hope, and love.” *Millennial Harbinger*, Aug. 1855; cited by Thomas Fountain, “Toronto’s Early Disciple Churches,” 216-217.

³¹ *Banner*, XVII, 3-4, 61.

³² McDiarmid, Obituary for T. C. Scott, 18-22.

³³ *Message of Good-Will to Men*, XVIII, 3-4 (Mar.-Apr. 1864), 61.

produced the separation, were found still to exist and the separation returned.³⁴ After the second withdrawal, the group met in a Temperance Hall on Richmond St. The annual reports of the Wellington County co-operation now appear to identify the Richmond St. church as the “Toronto” church.³⁵ In 1857 there were 16 members, “about” 20 in 1858, 14 in 1864, and 48 members reported in 1873.³⁶ Between the two congregations, there were now approximately 150 members. The population of the city had reached 56,000 in 1872.

The history of the churches of Christ in Toronto from the mid-point of the 19th century to the present is largely that of two congregational groups flowing from the above original two, “the conservatives” meeting in seven successive locations,³⁷ and “the progressives” also meeting at seven different sites.³⁸

The Richmond Street congregation moved to Pembroke Street in 1873. Two well-known American preachers and assistant editors, John F. Rowe of the *American Christian Review*, and Isaac Errett of the *Christian Quarterly*, both of Cincinnati, in reporting their respective visits to Toronto in 1873, each spoke of Thomas C. Scott and his leadership of a band of believers. Rowe said: “There is another church in the city [in addition to Shuter St.] composed of 50 members, under the superintendence of Brother Thomas C. Scott, a man of considerable ability and intelligence, who, in a way peculiar to himself, is trying to do what good he can.”³⁹ Errett wrote: “Elder Scott, a fine old Scotch gentleman ... came to this country over 30 years ago... They have just opened a new house of worship on South Pembroke St.”⁴⁰ Errett’s report continues: The location is east of Yonge St. and south of Dundas, in a “new and growing part of the city,” a brick building, 28 X 48 feet, on a lot 50 X 150 feet, costing a total of \$4,000. “Of this Brother Scott paid \$2,000 and bears the main portion of the burden re the interest for the rest; the members generally being poor.” Butchart identifies various family names associated with this church: Malcolm, Elvins, Kirk, Leary, and Culp.⁴¹ Scott represented the congregation in the co-operation; as well, he encouraged such churches as King, Pickering, and Vaughan as the visiting speaker, somewhat to uneasiness of the Pembroke members who preferred a regular preacher.⁴² Arrangements were made in 1875 for Hugh McDiarmid⁴³

³⁴ The October 1864 *Advisor* reported that certain “highly esteemed brethren” had withdrawn from the Shuter St. congregation. Cited by Butchart, 504.

³⁵ For example, “Toronto” is listed giving \$50.00 to the 1860-61 fund, whereas “Shuter-street Toronto” is listed as giving \$10.20. *Banner*, XV, 2 (Mar.-Apr. 1861), 76, 77. Again, “Toronto city” is listed as contributing \$60.00 to the 1863-64 fund, whereas “a member of Shuter St. Church, Toronto” gave \$10.00. *Message*, XVIII, 3-4 (Mar.-Apr. 1864), 56.

³⁶ Re Isaac Errett’s report. *Bible Index*, II, 1 (Nov. 1873), 11.

³⁷ Yonge St./ Shuter St./Temperance St./ Louisa St./Elm St./ Bathurst St./Bayview Ave.

³⁸ Two Richmond St. locations/Pembroke St./Occident Hall/Denison Ave./Cecil St./”Hillcrest.” The labels, “conservatives” and “progressives,” are those preferred by the respective groups themselves. However, when used to describe the opposite group, there is frequently a pejorative ring to the usage.

³⁹ *Bible Index*, I, 9 (July 1873), 141.

⁴⁰ *Bible Index*, II, 1 (Nov. 1873), 11. Elsewhere, Errett comments: Scott is “...the only elder at Pembroke street church. His life long study of the Scriptures enables him to administer to them (the church) faithful instruction, and his steady zeal prompts the cheerful consecrations of his talents and his means to the church, as the great work of his life.” *Bible Index*, II, 2 (Jan. 1874), 28.

⁴¹ Butchart, 507.

⁴² *Ibid.*

⁴³ Hugh McDiarmid was an Ontario native and a graduate of Bethany College. In 1877, along with E. Sheppard and C. Sinclair, as co-editors, he announced the plan to begin publishing the *Christian Pathway*.

to preach for three months at Pembroke St.⁴⁴ On December 3rd in 1876, four went forward at Pembroke for baptism, and Scott did the baptizing. On the 6th of December, he said, “I fear I have taken a cold.” He died on the 13th succumbing to typhoid pneumonia and was buried on the 16th. Butchart comments: “The death of T. C. Scott... was a great blow, from which it [the Pembroke church] never fully recovered. Scott [in effect], owned the building, but in his estate the church lost it.”⁴⁵ McDiarmid supported the group for a time but the congregation dissolved “perhaps late in 1877.”⁴⁶ For several months the “progressives” were without a congregation in Toronto.

In the meantime major developments were taking place within the Shuter St. church. As Toronto increased its role as the leading city in Ontario, the brethren sensed that somehow the movement should have more leadership emanating from the capital, perhaps as the publications center.⁴⁷ Seemingly from nowhere, as a bursting skyrocket, an initiative was indeed taken up in 1872 in Toronto—by the nephews of James Beaty Sr,

When “editorial and financial control of the *Bible Index* [was] offered to these editors,” they agreed to drop their earlier plan and take on the *Index*. McDiarmid’s comment was, “In everything save the name, the *Index* will be what the *Pathway* proposed to do.” Again, “[The] *Index* came to our control unsought.” *Bible Index*, Second Series, I, 1 (Jan. 1877), 2. McDiarmid, with the dropping out of the two mentioned editors, became the editor of the *Bible Index* during 1877-79. He was also active as an evangelist employed by the Wellington County co-operation, 1875-1882. In 1880 he launched *The Christian Sentinel* and, again reaching some level of approval from the Beatys, merged the two papers, *Bible Index and Christian Sentinel*, publishing it for two years, 1881-1882. He left the province in January 1883 to serve as an editor with the *Christian Standard* in Cincinnati. He later became president of Bethany College. *Bible Index*, Second Series, I, 1 (Jan. 1877), 2.

⁴⁴ Pembroke was one of three congregations (along with Everton and Erin Centre) to be served by McDiarmid for three months each during the year, plus one quarter of the year spent preaching in the field. His work for the year was to be supported by the co-operation. James Black is quoted with respect to McDiarmid’s assignments, “He is not *The Pastor*, nor will any of our preachers be silenced by ‘the arrangement’” This reflects the changing view toward the “located preacher” and implies tensions associated with the change. *Bible Index*, III, 2 (Feb. 1875), 48.

⁴⁵ Butchart, 507. Butchart cites January 1877 as the month of Scott’s passing. Rather, this is the month the obituary appeared in the *Bible Index* Second Series, I, 1 (Jan. 1877), 18-22.

⁴⁶ Butchart, 507.

⁴⁷ A frequent question advanced to David Oliphant Jr in his publishing work was, “Would not the city [Toronto] be the most appropriate locality in the province from which to issue the publication pleading reform as pled by disciples?” He made a reply to this on one occasion, “In respect to the city of Toronto being a suitable center for the publishing interests of the churches of disciples in Canada, no modest man, however qualified, would be either willing or able to decide a question of such breadth. Unless a revelation from heaven comes to us upon the subject, it is more likely than otherwise that this question, so far as we are individually concerned, will be left for settlement of many men.” *Message of Good-Will to Men*, XVIII, 3-4 (Mar.-Apr. 1864), 61.

Robert⁴⁸ and James Beaty Jr,⁴⁹ two of the city's outstanding men, with the launching of the periodical, the *Bible Index*. The decade leading up to the first issue of the *Index* (November 1872) had been discouraging for the Disciples. The great disturbance of the Civil War in the USA and the dislocations surrounding the move to Confederation in Canada, were a backdrop to a growing conflict within the brotherhood over the best and Biblical way to do evangelism. The resulting rancour had all but ruined Oliphant; his editorial activities had moved away from center stage and were soon to be over. The first generation of labourers was growing old, and it seemed that few were stepping forward to replace them. The Wellington co-operation was faltering.⁵⁰ The June meetings had all but been given up.⁵¹ A vigorous effort from the center was just what was needed. The Beaty

⁴⁸ Robert Beaty (1824-1896) was born at Ashdale Farm in Trafalgar township, the oldest son of thirteen children of John and Elizabeth (Stewart) Beaty. Not physically suited to the rugged work of pioneer farming he was sent to live with his uncle in Toronto, James Beaty Sr when he was 18 (1842). He was enrolled in Upper Canada College (established 1830) where he studied for three years. While raised in the English church, under the influence of his uncle, no doubt, he wrote home to his parents seeking permission to be baptized. He was baptized through a hole cut in the ice. Shortly after, his parents rode to Toronto in an oxcart to be baptized as well. This was the beginning of the church of Christ in Omagh. In 1845 Robert went to work for his uncle. When the *Leader* was begun, its management fell to Robert, a valuable training for his later work in publishing the *Index*. In 1867 he launched out on his own as a banker, broker, and real estate developer. He became a stockholder of the Western Assurance Company at its founding in 1851 and a director in 1862. Robert was married to Sarah Carroll, a native of Ireland, and three children were born in their family, the youngest of whom, Sallie, passed away July 14, 1877, age 20. Drawn from: Descendants of Robert Beaty; "Omagh: Restoration Miniature," by Steve May, *The Campbell-Stone Movement in Ontario*, 251-263; Sallie's obituary, *Bible Index*, 2nd series, I, 9 (Sept. 1877), 287.

⁴⁹ James Beaty Jr (1831-1899), the youngest of John and Elizabeth's four sons, was also born at Ashdale Farm. He went to Toronto in 1849 and eventually studied law, being called to the bar in 1855. He was made Queen's Council for the Dominion government in 1872 and later for the provincial government. Also in 1872 he received the degree of B.C.L. from Trinity College and the degree D.C.L in 1875. In 1877 he was elected alderman for the St. James Ward, Toronto and two years later mayor (having been defeated the previous year, 1878), returning again the next year. In 1880, he represented West Toronto as an MP, returning again in 1882 through to 1887. He married his cousin, Fannie Beaty, Nov. 10, 1858, and to this union two children were born. Descendants of Robert Beaty.

⁵⁰ The "Annual June Meeting of Churches of Christ Co-operating for the Spread of the Gospel" met in Everton, June 25, 1870. (T. Scott represented "Toronto (Richmond St.)", one of the nine churches participating.) The following resolution was passed: "In consequence of several churches in connection formerly with the present co-operation manifesting a strong, and we trust sincere, desire to unite together in smaller co-operations, be it therefore resolved that the present General Co-operation, represented here this day, be and is hereby dissolved by mutual consent: and that consequently, all Churches hitherto connected with it previously are at perfect liberty to unite or co-operate together for the purpose of preaching the Gospel in the most efficient and desirable manner they think proper..." A second motion was passed: "That the Churches in the Counties of Wellington, Halton, with the church in King, and that in Richmond St., Toronto agree to co-operate for the spread of the Gospel for the ensuing year." *Bible Indicator*, III, 2 (July, 1870), 29-30.

⁵¹ Joseph Ash's reflections concerning this period, directed in 1874 to James Beaty Jr, capture the condition: "Dear Brother, As the large gatherings of the brethren for the proclamation of the Gospel, the renewal and formation of acquaintances, call June meetings, have just now closed, I have passed in my mind conversations and plans you and I had years ago when we saw the coldness and laxity of the brethren; our Christian papers all failed; the June meetings given up, a deep gloom followed which seemed to hover over every church nearly – what could be done to revive the cause, rebuild the harmony and confidence of the saints, stimulate them to renewed action and zeal. My suggestion was a periodical on a firm basis, and the renewal of our old June meetings, then a united and positive action in sending out a host of evangelists, *well paid and well sustained*. I remember well your cordial approval with this excellent addition. Yes, let us have June meetings, and more than one; let us have five or six. Not further to recapitulate, the paper is and

brothers had long been in training; they were now in their prime.⁵² The brothers not only took on the publication of the new periodical, the *Bible Index*,⁵³ but they extended their energies, by preaching around the province, as encouragers as well.⁵⁴ The June Meetings were revived and in multiples.⁵⁵ The *Index* provided the brotherhood with a window on its renewed action. But it soon became apparent that the brothers had received the mantle of their uncle.

Butchart is of the opinion that “a swarming...possibly of younger people” and led by the Beaty brothers, from Shuter St., occurred in about 1874,⁵⁶ and that this group was “possibly joined by some from Richmond St.”⁵⁷ The first location for this group was Albert Hall, 191 Yonge Street. Meanwhile, the Shuter St. congregation lost its building.

the June meetings are I hope, firmly inaugurated; the effect to me is cheering and encouraging in a high degree.” *Bible Index*, II, 8 (Aug. 1874), 240-241.

⁵² It is not within the scope of this paper to trace out in detail the “Co-operation Controversy.” Suffice it to note that the long-established leadership of the brethren of the congregation at Everton, Eramosa Township, Wellington County, including the respected and leading influence of James Black, “father of the co-operation,” in providing an organization through which the churches could join together in regional evangelism, represented a rural locus of influence. This was now matched by a push for evangelism by small groups of congregations banded together. This latter position was that of the elders of the Athol, Prince Edward County elders in 1861, a position championed by Oliphant, which caused such a stir throughout the province. This was also the position of the Beatys and thus became an urban-centered promotion. Predictably, the regional cooperation grew at the expense of congregations sensing their accountability for their own evangelistic work. The Oliphant-Beaty position should have encouraged a local sense of involvement in outreach. Unfortunately, the growing debate absorbed the energies of all concerned and evangelism in Ontario, including Toronto, was not well advanced by either scheme. When H. B. Sherman in 1883 launched a second, and ultimately competing paper, in Meaford, the *Christian Worker*, and at the same time worked for the transformation of the Ontario cooperation of churches into a self-perpetuating society, a goal accomplished at Acton, the separation became seemingly irreversible.

⁵³ The *Bible Index*, which would continue for 20 years, was launched by John Malcolm Trout, publisher of the *Monetary Times*, and James Beaty Jr, and was printed by the *Monetary Times Printing Company*. In the beginning, “Trout and Beaty were the undisclosed initiators and editors. Trout’s untimely death in 1876 left this new paper in the hands of James Beaty, lawyer...” In 1880, James’ brother, Robert Beaty became its editor and so served until its demise in 1893. Eugene Perry, *A History of Religious Periodicals in the Restoration Movement in Canada*, (Beamsville, ON: Gospel Herald Foundation; an 1970 M.A. thesis, Pepperdine University; published in 2003), 79.

⁵⁴ The editors in their first year of publishing proposed that a series of “June Meetings,” i.e. regional evangelistic meetings, be planned in five locations throughout Ontario for each of the five Sundays in 1873. The churches responded positively and engaged the services of John F. Rowe and several local evangelists. Robert Beaty was Rowe’s traveling partner to the June meetings at Hillier and Mosa. *Bible Index* I, 9 (July 1873), 134. In 1874, again the *Index* took the initiative and Benjamin Franklin, editor of the *American Christian Review* was the featured visiting speaker at the various meetings. The possibility of Franklin’s return in 1875 was noted following the 1874 efforts. The editor made this observation: “My opinion is, that during June and September, he could visit several points. And the rest of the time might be spent in Toronto. If the two churches in the city would co-operate in assisting Bro. Franklin in holding meetings for some two months, my opinion is that some permanent good could be done in Toronto.” *Bible Index*, II, 7 (July, 1874), 206-207. In 1875, however, this was the message from the *Index*: “Brethren, are we to have any meetings in June this year? Where? When? The arrangements are entirely in your hands...We do not intend to do as we did the two preceding years; for the purpose of showing how easily the whole matter could be arranged...” *Bible Index*, III, 3 (Mar. 1875), 76.

⁵⁵ The “June Meeting” began, firstly, as the time for the annual business meeting of those churches cooperating in regional evangelism. The meetings began to attract large gatherings for worship and fellowship with often thousands in attendance. They also became the occasion for extended gospel meetings. The June meetings encouraged by the Beatys had this latter emphasis in mind. In June 1873, meetings were conducted in Toronto (beginning May 31), Beamsville (i.e. Culp’s Settlement, Clinton

That is to say, the building was removed from them. On Sunday, Nov. 22, 1874, after five year's absence from services, James Beaty Sr attended and participated in the service at Shuter St. At the end of the service, J. M. Trout arose and "suggested the propriety and duty of making some explanation for his past course to the church...[regarding his] violating commands not to forsake the assembly...and to break bread." Beaty replied that he had no fault to confess. After the meeting, he spoke to several brethren reminding them of his ownership of the building and stating his intention to occupy and use it. "All who were not suited had better go somewhere else." On the Monday night following, at a well-attended meeting, it was determined to send a delegation of four men to visit with Brother Beaty. The latter refused to have anything to do with the deputation. At the Wednesday night meeting it was agreed to seek another place of meeting. Arrangements were made for the Temperance Hall on Temperance Street, where the first meeting was held Nov. 29, 1874.⁵⁸

Then in March 1876, according to a news item reported in the *Index*, those meeting at Albert Hall "have purchased a lot of land on Alice Street, north side, a few steps west of Yonge Street." The facility prepared for meeting was identified as "the Alice Street Christian Church"⁵⁹ However, within months, i.e. in late 1876 or in January of

Township), Mosa Township (near Glencoe), Meaford, Hillier (Prince Edward County), and Everton (Eramosa Township near Rockwood). John F. Rowe, assistant editor of the *American Christian Review* was the hoped for featured speaker. *Bible Index*, I, 7 (May 1873), 103-104. The July issue of the *Bible Index* gave a detailed account of the meetings, even listing those in attendance and giving their home locations, and describing Rowe's work. The overall results of the meetings included thirty people baptized, 4,000 people collectively instructed, and 1,200 to 1,500 brethren assembled on the Lord's Day, meeting "each other with general cordiality, brotherly kindness, and hopefulness." I, 9 (July 1873), 132.

⁵⁶ If this date is accurate, the move may have been later in the year. The spring of the year was a busy time for the Beatys, preparing for the round of June Meetings with Benjamin Franklin. Franklin began his month's work by speaking at Shuter St. May 31, "...he spoke in the Shuter St. House to increasing audiences up to Thursday of the first week. One was baptized. [Those visiting included] Wm. Trout, Meaford...Barclay from Brougham...Rowe from King...John Henry from Butterfield..." *Bible Index*, II, 7 (July 1874), 202.

⁵⁷ Butchart, 506.

⁵⁸ *Bible Index*, II, 12 (Dec. 1874), 359-360. Beaty had no doubt spent much time in Ottawa during the period 1867-1873 as a Member of Parliament. However, his five-year absence from services, 1869-1874 cannot be wholly explained on this account. Beaty, hurt financially in some way because of the Pacific Scandal, declared bankruptcy in 1875. Subsequently, the Shuter St. property was sold. *Bible Index*, II, 12 (Dec. 1874), 359-360. (The building was sold to the Roman Catholic Church to be used by the Syrian Catholics. In turn the St. Vincent de Paul Society used it. Perhaps around 1915 the brick building was torn down.) Somewhat inexplicably it was reported in August 1875, "Two persons were immersed in Shuter Street Congregation last Lord's Day week." *BI*, III, 8 (Aug. 1875), 231. In the same issue of the *Bible Index*, the American preacher George W. Colston reported speaking for the "the brethren" in Toronto. "Tarried with the brethren and spoke for them on Lord's Day, morning and night, this congregation has every element of success, posses means, intelligence, and as good, if not better speaking talent than any known to me in the province. With a good house (*they have none*) [italics mine] and the talent and influence they possess, the primitive gospel should become a power in their growing city, that that the love of the truth will stir them up to diligence and duty" (p. 234). As the Pembroke St. church was meeting in their own building at this time, the reference must be to the former Shuter Street congregation.

⁵⁹ The report continues: "Alice Street leads off from Yonge opposite Steiner's marble works on Yonge. Alice Street is the third street running west from Yonge north of the Catholic Cathedral. It is in a good locality, central and generally convenient. In the meantime they are fitting up the cottage on the lot into a temporary meetinghouse, to accommodate from 120 to 150. There will be a suitable baptistery with convenient and comfortable dressing rooms in the house. It is expected to be ready (the Lord willing) for

1877,⁶⁰ the “Alice Street Christian Church” relocated to Louisa Street. The *Index* noted, “The Congregation of Christians formerly worshipping in Alice Street have removed to a commodious and well adapted building, corner of James and Louisa Streets, Toronto.”⁶¹ The former Reformed Episcopal building was rented.⁶² It appears that Louisa Street was now, by-and-large, the home of the former Shuter St. congregation.⁶³ This location would be home for this church for the next 24 years.⁶⁴ News of meetings and baptisms at Louisa St. appear in the periodicals from time to time. Notices of some interest include: the preaching of Joseph Franklin (son of Benjamin Franklin) for the entire month of May in 1877;⁶⁵ the visit of Timothy Coop, of Southport, England, a leading member in the British Restoration movement, July 1883;⁶⁶ and the “talk” by Mrs. Delauney, who served along with her husband as missionaries in Paris.⁶⁷ Leading members in November 1883, included Dr. O. S. Winstanley, Thomas Campton, Robert Beaty, Edward Trout, C. C. Pomeroy, George J. Barclay, James Beaty Jr, and John T. Wilson. The membership in that year was given at “about 100 members.”⁶⁸ The year 1883 was also the time of (1) the publication of James Beaty Jr’s booklet, *Paying the Pastor: Unscriptural and Papistical*,⁶⁹ and (2) the explosive and ultimately fatal, for the unity of the movement, “Acton Sect” event that so exercised James Beaty Jr.⁷⁰

public use about the last Lord’s Day in March, or at latest the first Lord’s Day in April. The building will be known as the ‘Alice Street Christian Church.’” *Bible Index*, IV, 3 (March 1876), 75-76.

⁶⁰ George Clendenan is reported as preaching on Sunday, Jan. 21, 1877 “for the brethren now meeting at Louisa St., Toronto (formerly Alice-street).” *Bible Index*, Second Series, I, 2 (Feb. 1877), 60.

⁶¹ *Bible Index*, Second Series, I, 2 (Feb. 1877). Butchart (p. 507) states concerning the Louisa St. church: “This historic church was situated at the S. E. corner of Louisa and Albert Streets.” In 1883, Reuben Butchart began attending the Louisa St. congregation (cf. p. 508); his knowledge of the later location of the church was first hand. However, other comments regarding the “‘churchy’ edifice” i.e. the Episcopal building still being used in 1879 or 1880, suggest that the “Albert Street” reference is in error. In the Nov. 1883 *Bible Index*, Louisa St. is identified as located on “the corner of James, one street west of Yonge, two streets north of Queen” (XI, 131, 350-1). The Eaton Center now covers this site.

⁶² Butchart, 508.

⁶³ What produced the Temperance Hall group? One scenario might be: (1) Some tension existed at Shuter St. that resulted in a group including the Beaty brothers to withdraw to Albert Hall (1874). (2) The remnant at Shuter St., without James Beaty Sr’s nephews present, was more readily displaced (1874). (3) The possibility of reuniting the group meeting on Alice St. with the group meeting on Temperance St., along with the possible growing reality that the converted facility on Alice St. would not be adequate, plus the availability of a “commodious and well adapted building,” prompted a double move to Louisa St. (1876). As no additional information has been found, however, regarding the group meeting in the Temperance Hall, it’s merging with Alice St. could have occurred at any time in 1875 or 1876.

⁶⁴ The Shuter St. location had served this congregation for 34 years.

⁶⁵ *Bible Index*, Second Series, I, 5 (May 1877), 139. Two were baptized. I, 7, (July 1877), 219.

⁶⁶ “Bro. Coop in his address took the position, and urged it strongly, that when the child believed the truth and desired to be immersed, it was not the province of the Christians to refuse permission on account of youth. He contended also that the word ‘reverend’ was as proper as the word ‘holy’ and that every follower of Christ who is called ‘holy’ should be called ‘reverend,’ for ‘holy and reverend is his name.’” *Bible Index*, XI, 128 (Aug. 1883), 248.

⁶⁷ Wednesday, Sept. 25: “The ‘talk,’ not a lecture nor sermon, was most interesting...” (re six years of mission work with 73 baptisms). XI, 130 (Oct. 1883), 317.

⁶⁸ XI, 131 (Nov. 1883), 350-1.

⁶⁹ H. B. Sherman, editor of the *Christian Worker*, announced in May that he had just received a copy of *Paying the Pastor*, 79 pages, and that he planned to read and review it. II, 7 (May 1883), 3.

⁷⁰ See footnote #47. Beaty and Sherman ranted at each other in the pages of their respective papers following the formation of the society for Ontario evangelism in Acton, Ontario, June 2. In a letter to the *Christian Worker*, C. J. Lister rebukes both papers for “calling brethren bad and harsh names” and that they

In 1879, the Louisa St. congregation was the only Church of Christ in Toronto. Some of the former Pembroke St. church apparently fellowshipped with this newly located work.⁷¹ In 1879, however, a Sunday school initiative was begun in the “west end” of Toronto, in the Queen St. and Bathurst area. At first it was called the “West End Mission.” An American preacher, T. B. Scovil,⁷² who had been preaching around Ontario, Christopher C. Pomeroy, a member at Louisa St, and his brother C. Edward Pomeroy, recently from Cobourg, provided leadership. The Sunday school was a “union” effort⁷³ and a local businessman, D. W. Clendenan was made superintendent. The leaders formed a small fellowship and secured the Occident Hall on the corner of Queen St and Bathurst St. for Sunday activities “for one year.” On February 16, 1882 twelve men and women “organized” as a church.⁷⁴ The Wellington County co-operation, determining to throw its efforts into urban church building, identified this work, “a new cause in the West End of Toronto in 1882,” for one of its efforts.⁷⁵ Baptisms were conducted at Louisa St. By 1885 there were 54 names on the role. Later, the congregation located an empty church building for rent on Denison Ave. at Queen St. and moved there on February 16, 1886. Butchart describes the developments of this congregation: “The Ontario Co-operation sent James Lediard as evangelist and to do pastoral work. A board of managing brethren was in being, with scriptural elders [i.e. James Menzies, James Stewart and John Smart] and deacons in charge... [Lediard was replaced] by John R. Gaff, of York, Pa. He came in January 1888... He effected *organization* also: something new in a Disciples church to find a building committee, a music committee, and also a financial committee. A Choir was directed by C. C. Pomeroy... A Sunday School was soon followed by a Christian Endeavor Society—that organization then coming into prominence. The Co-operation further helped by sending evangelist C. W. Martz, of Indianapolis, Ind.... By January 1887, there were 161 names enrolled. In February, 1887, the church bought a lot on Cecil St.” It wasn’t until March 15, 1891 that the move was made.⁷⁶

In September 1889 “a number of brethren [30] withdrew from us [i.e. the Denison Ave. church] over what they felt to be fundamental differences of opinion as to how a

should be “sorry and ashamed.” The publishers of the *Worker*, Law and Whitelaw, agreed. “We have promised that we would have no more personal wrangles in our columns.” II, 11 (Sept. 1883), 1, 2.

⁷¹ The demise of Pembroke St. and the relocation of Shuter St. brethren to Louisa St. had occurred at the same time, late in 1877.

⁷² T. B. Scovil, it was later determined, had an unsavory reputation and was “found out” before he could do much damage in Toronto. In Algonac, MI he led “an uprising with the group in a church that had been organized in 1852. Scovil and his friends broke the lock and for a time held the place “in opposition to those who refuse to recognize him.” “This man tried in Toronto to lead away some brethren, on the pretence of doing great good, but the spread of truth being the only object of those who met with him, in what was called the West End Mission, they withdrew from him...” *Bible Index*, VIII, 88 (Apr. 1880), 117-118.

⁷³ “The Bible school was to be carried on by a Union Sunday School Association, entirely unsectarian, with Bro. D. W. Clendenan as Superintendent.” *Bible Index*, Second Series, III 4 (Apr. 1879), 123.

⁷⁴ Eleven signed as charter members: C. E. Pomeroy, C. C. Pomeroy, Chas. Gentleman, Jos. Stack, John Beaty, Mrs. J. A. Pomeroy, Mary E. Pomeroy, Elizabeth Leary, Annie Leary, Eliza C. Black, Annie Black. “The name “Church of Christ, Occident Hall” was chosen quite early. Butchart, 512.

⁷⁵ See Butchart, 82, 87, 410. C. C. Pomeroy attended the annual meeting of the Wellington County Co-operation, representing the West End Church, Toronto. *Bible Index & Christian Sentinel*, II, 6 (June 1882), 3. “Brother J. G. (sic, G. J.) Barclay will preach for the ‘West End’ church in Toronto on Lord’s Day nights until better arrangements can be made. The co-operation helping to sustain him. We hope to do more in helping the weak place, as our treasury is enlarged.” *Christian Worker*, III, 3 (Jan. 1884), 2.

⁷⁶ Butchart, 512-513.

church should be conducted. This meant mainly eldership rule and no instrumental music [as well as ‘mutual edification’].”⁷⁷ Included in the departure were most of the Denison Ave. leadership: James Menzies,⁷⁸ Stewart (deacon), John Smart, and George J. Barclay and, as well William Forrester and William Smart. These were all from Louisa St. originally except for the Smarts who arrived at Denison Ave. in 1886.⁷⁹ At first this group met in the home of John Smart, 219 Euclid Ave. These then began a new “west end” effort. Thirty-three brethren began meeting in Broadway Hall, (the three-story building was named “I Wardell”), and were called the Spadina Ave. church. At its opening service, Oct. 20, 1889, this statement was read, “Our purpose is ...to teach and practise only that which they (‘Christ and His apostles’) have authorized... Our faith is common. Our opinions are our own, we ask no man to accept them, nor do we bind them on any. Christians are sons of liberty, God’s free men. We aim to exalt Christ above all human creeds and confessions of faith.”⁸⁰ This move was the occasion for the last mention of James Beaty Sr in conjunction with our study before his death in 1892. Taking note of this effort, ninety-one year old Beaty directed this letter to a city newspaper, the *Globe*: “To the Church of Christ (Disciples) Broadway Hall, Spadina Ave., Dear Brethren: I beg to congratulate you on the noble stand you have taken in practically resisting retrogression. I am glad I have lived to learn that there are yet those who have courage to trample under foot hirelings calling themselves Disciples. As one of the oldest Disciples in Toronto I charge you that when you reiterate the Gospel to the world you will not mince the matter...”⁸¹

Spadina Ave. was home for this conservative group from October 2, 1889 until October 20, 1897 when it moved to Brunswick Hall, on Brunswick Ave., “the best then available.” The congregation consisted of 63 members, 19 remaining of the original 33. The next five years were spent at this Hall, 1897-1902. They were prosperous years with the membership increasing to about 225. This improvement was attributed largely to the labours of William D. Campbell who arrived in 1900.⁸² In 1902, the group moved again, this time to Bathurst Street. In the meantime, the Louisa St. congregation had carried on and in March 1, 1900, made another move, to Elm Street, to a building formerly owned by the “New Jerusalem” church,⁸³ but this building was then sold in the middle of 1905.⁸⁴

⁷⁷ Butchart, 513. Butchart had begun meeting with the Denison Ave. church in 1885 (511).

⁷⁸ James Menzies had resided in Norval for 58 years. He died June 18, 1894, in his 86th year. Clearly, there were those of a conservative bent among the Denison Ave. This may infer that conditions at Shuter St. were not ideal even for those of conservative values, and that there may have been a migration of sorts from Shuter to Denison to Spadina/Brunswick and back to Bathurst St.

⁷⁹ The elderly James Menzies, son of John Menzies (cf. Norval, 1820), was said by Joseph Ash to have “bolted from the innovation [i.e. from Denison Ave.]” *Bible Index*, XVIII, 205 (Jan. 1890), 21. The presence of these conservative men in the Denison Ave. congregation may suggest that the two major groups were not uniformly “progressive” or “conservative,” and/or that some aspects of the Louisa St. group may have been too conservative for some.

⁸⁰ This statement was reported in the *Globe*. *Bible Index*, XVIII, 193 (Nov. 1889), 337-338.

⁸¹ Beaty’s letter was also reprinted in the *Index*, 351.

⁸² *Bible Student*, 4, 2 (Feb. 1907), 1.

⁸³ When Elm St. joined with Bathurst St., “a few consorted with Cecil St.” Butchart, 510.

⁸⁴ The Elm St. congregation continued to be identified in the church directory of the “loyal” churches printed in the *Bible Student* (1904-1913) until the end of 1905. “It is reported that the brethren of Elm St., Toronto, congregation have sold their house to the Jews who have converted it into a synagogue. It is expected they will buy elsewhere in the city.” *Bible Student*, 2, 8 (Aug. 1905), 3.

Butchart states that most of its membership moved to the Bathurst St. church with a few going on to Cecil St.⁸⁵ We will return to Bathurst St. shortly.

We left the story of the Denison Ave. church at the time of the withdrawal of those who went to Spadina Ave., in the year 1889. In the same year, and from Denison, another group left, to establish a congregation in the “Toronto Junction” even before that village became part of Toronto.⁸⁶ An increasing number of those attending Denison Ave., which had begun as the “West End Mission,” were living farther west, beyond the service of Sunday streetcars. Beginning Aug. 11, 1889, they met for about a year in a rented facility, Heydon Hall, with John Munro⁸⁷ leading the services.⁸⁸ On March 1890, the decision was made to construct a meetinghouse. This was accomplished on land donated by D. W. Clendenan and opened on Oct. 5, 1890, on the corner of Annette and Keele Streets.⁸⁹ By 1899 the Keele St. church numbered 79 members, about 100 in 1907, and 152 in 1920.⁹⁰ In 1967, Keele St. separated itself from the Disciples of Christ in Canada to be identified as an Independent Christian Church.⁹¹ Keele St. believed in church planting, being responsible for six new efforts: Russell Rd., North Avenue Rd., 222 Broadway in North Toronto, Westway, Willowdale, and a Korean-language service at Keele St.⁹²

On March 15, 1891, the Denison Ave church dedicated its building on Cecil St. near Spadina Ave. Thus, the “progressives” in Toronto found their main home in the Cecil Street Church of Christ and continued there from 1891 until 1921 when they shared in the establishment of the Hillcrest Church of Christ (Disciples). The “new white brick structure, of impressive style” was the first to be constructed by this group in its approximately 45-year history. Up to 1907, according to Butchart’s estimate, this church

⁸⁵ Butchart, 510.

⁸⁶ Toronto Junction was incorporated as a village in 1887, as a township in 1889, and a city in 1908. It became West Toronto Junction and then was annexed by the city of Toronto in 1909. “This new community seems to have been the special project of a lawyer and real estate speculator named Daniel Webster Clendanan [cf. the D. W. Clendenan of Occident Hall beginnings].” He bought the former Carleton Race Track [where the first Queen’s plate was run in 1860, Don Juan winning the Queen’s 500 guineas] in the area bounded by Keele, Dundas, Bloor, and Evelyn Ave. Clendanan developed streets, sold lots, and became mayor in 1889 and 1891. His cousin, Dr. George Washington Clendenan moved his practice to this area. Mary Ann Brown, “The History of Keele St. Church of Christ, Toronto,” *Campbell-Stone*, 231. The Clendenans were from the Niagara Peninsula and relatives of Amos Clendenan, one of the early pioneer preachers in Ontario. Butchart, 515.

⁸⁷ John Munro was from Kent county and an honour graduate, U. of T. He served the congregation until 1898. Butchart, 515.

⁸⁸ The hall, on the corner of Keele and Dundas, was in the Campbell Block, previously called the Heydon Buildings. Brown, 231.

⁸⁹ “It was considered most comfortable with carpet, pump organ, gas lights, and a coal furnace,” capacity, 250. Brown, 231.

⁹⁰ Butchart, 517.

⁹¹ “At a meeting in Oct., on a motion duly carried, it was determined that the congregation ‘shall be known as the Keele Street Church of Christ’ and not, as formerly, ‘The Church of the Disciples of Christ at West Toronto Junction.’ This marked the formal separation of the congregation from the reorganization of the All Canada Conference of Disciples of Christ.” Brown, “Keele St.,” *Campbell-Stone*, 246.

⁹² Russell Rd. merged with the UCC; North Avenue Rd. closed; Broadway merged with Bayview Ave. in 1943; Westway Christian Church, at Kipling and The Westway (now 6 Kilburn Pl., Etobicoke), in Weston, begun in 1957, continues; Willowdale continued from 1958 to 1975. Brown, 232-233. The Ontario Bible School was located at Keele St., 1938-1943 and 1958-1964; and Toronto Christian Seminary operated there from 1972 to 1999.

had served 1,000 people in its various locations.⁹³ The provincial Co-operation supported this church, “its first major cause,” that became a haven for many young people leaving the farm behind for life in the city. In 1906, it was reported that a tennis court had been constructed on the premises and that the “Cecil Club” had been formed, “helping young men [have] right attitudes to right things.”⁹⁴ In 1915, a pipe organ was installed.⁹⁵ By 1914 the membership stood at 362.⁹⁶

Cecil St. assisted in two church plantings: the Wychwood congregation in 1899, located on the corner of Vaughan Rd and Helena Ave. (which later became the site for Hillcrest) and the “Central” church in 1908. Wychwood was “the direct child of Cecil St., organized as a mission in 1897.”⁹⁷ Once again, the work was on the growing edge of the city that lacked Sunday streetcar service. The conduct of a Sunday school and earlier preaching were in a fire hall on Alcina Ave, with C. L. Burton and J. L. Leary identified as leaders. Organization of the Wychwood congregation was effected on November 15, 1899 with 20 names on the role. Dr. Thomas J. Page took a leading role in the new congregation. A brick building was dedicated in 1901. By 1902 there were 38 members.⁹⁸ Sometime between 1912-1914, the church bought 40 feet of land adjoining their property, while retaining their corner lot.⁹⁹ The view was expressed, however, that without the support of the Co-operation, Wychwood “would not have succeeded.”¹⁰⁰

The second major project for the Co-operation after Cecil St. was what was first called the Lansdowne Mission, then the St. Clarens Ave. church,¹⁰¹ and finally, the Central Church of Christ. Both Cecil St. and Wychwood¹⁰² helped in the early stages. Organized in May of 1909, the Co-operation invested in it heavily, in the amount of \$1,000 annually up until 1922 and reducing thereafter, as well as supplying a substantial loan for the purchase of “a disused plaster church” property for \$1,600. Rufus W. Stevenson¹⁰³ from Prince Edward Island “was its first important worker before and after organization.” The membership grew from 48 in 1909, 54 in 1910, to 75 by 1914.¹⁰⁴ On December 29, 1922, a basement building was dedicated having a capacity of 450, the church being described as “one of our strongest efforts to get Churches of Christ in urban areas.”¹⁰⁵ By June 1924 there were 100 members and “the prospects were bright.” But in 1936 trouble arose and 30 members withdrew.¹⁰⁶ Unnamed troubles persisted until pastor

⁹³ “At last we had become a people, with a church home of our very own. Gone were the memories of ill-equipped mission hall days, and a revamped church building.” Butchart, 517-518.

⁹⁴ *Bible Student*, 3, 9 (Sept. 1906), 4.

⁹⁵ Butchart, 519.

⁹⁶ *Ibid.*, 519, 526.

⁹⁷ *Ibid.*, 522.

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, 524.

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, 525.

¹⁰¹ There is no St. Clarens Ave. listed in the current map of Toronto.

¹⁰² The Wychwood church gave \$40 to the “Lansdowne Mission” in 1908. Butchart, 524.

¹⁰³ He left for Saskatchewan in 1914 and died in 1926. A bronze plaque was later placed in the Central building to honour Rufus W. Stevenson’s long career on “The Island.” Butchart, 289, 526.

¹⁰⁴ *Ibid.*, 525, 526.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, 527.

¹⁰⁶ The Keele St. record identifies 40 persons transferring from Central somewhere before 1940. Butchart, 517.

Halsey Wakelin is praised as the “restorer of an almost destroyed congregation...”¹⁰⁷ Central was still operating in 1947.¹⁰⁸

Before we leave the 19th century completely behind, one additional “conservative” effort must be identified, the “East Toronto” work on Main St., the forerunner of the Strathmore Blvd. church. Duncan Stirling, who was baptized through the ice in Meaford, March 16, 1863, and who preached for a number of years in the Georgian Bay area, is linked to its beginnings. In frail health and just in his 47th year, he moved in 1889 to East Toronto where he remained an invalid for an extended period. Through the efforts of his wife, a church was established in his house, but Duncan Stirling was not able to participate in the services. Later, he removed his membership to the Bathurst congregation, where he was named an “elder,” a distinction that was more “honorary rather than active.”¹⁰⁹ The district of East Toronto “over the Don” was “thinly settled” at that time. From the Stirling home the small group moved to a hall on Gerrard St. and then to a hall at Main St.¹¹⁰ Edward Trout from Louisa St. joined the group; he was the owner of the hall and would not take any rent.¹¹¹ Preaching support for this group came from the Spadina Ave./Brunswick Hall church through such men as George J. Barclay, R. Riley and William Forrester. There is a listing for the “East Toronto” church in the directory of the first issue of the *Bible Student*, Jan. 1904, “meeting at 3:00 p.m.” In 1907 the church is listed as meeting for worship at 11:00 a.m.¹¹²

As the new century dawned, the two main bodies of the people pursuing a Restorationist posture were now all but completely separated from each other. They took their respective identities as Disciples of Christ and Churches of Christ. For all the Disciples’ espousal of love for truth and unity, they had not gained sufficient strength to achieve reconciliation, to merge their fellowships, or to resist the final division. Coming only slowly to the fore in leadership for the province, Toronto was now in the eye of the storm, and the Toronto churches shared in the tragedy of rupture that cursed the continent. In 1900 there were three congregations of the progressive position: Cecil St., Keele St. and Wychwood. For the conservatives there were Louisa St./Elm St., Brunswick Ave., and East Toronto. The membership for each body totaled approximately

¹⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, 525.

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, 529.

¹⁰⁹ Duncan Stirling’s father, living near Huntingdon, Que., was raised a Presbyterian. As a young adult, he studied the Scriptures and determined to be baptized, traveling 20 miles to locate a Baptist preacher. He moved to Meaford in 1862 and discovered the Disciples. Duncan was born in Lower Canada, March 16, 1842. He married Harriet Ann Trout, March 31, 1870. In 1877, as a 35-year old, he began fulltime preaching, with the new work at Warton. After four years, he left a congregation of about 100 members. During the next five to six years he preached at Kilsyth and Meaford, and helped to establish works at Cape Rich and Euphrasia township (later Griersville). He died May 1, 1912. *Bible Student*, Obituary by W. T. Stirling (son), 9, 6 (June 12), 3.

¹¹⁰ Butchart locates the hall at Main St. and “Sedgewicke” (p. 529). There is no “Sedgewicke” St. or Ave. that links with Main St. However, there is a “Swanwick” and Main St. in East Toronto. Audrey Wright who recalls Hedley Whitelaw’s identification of this location for East Toronto confirmed “Swanwick”.

¹¹¹ Rather, Trout suggested that an equivalent amount be sent annually to a mission in India. This was the interest of his wife, Dr. Jennie K. Trout, renowned as the first licensed female doctor in Canada. Butchart, 529.

¹¹² In the *Bible Student* periodically are reports of some activity at East Toronto: East Toronto members, meet regularly with the Wychwood Park and Bathurst personnel giving attention to their respective Sunday School programs. Gospel meetings were conducted by L. J. Keffer in 1911, F. Cowin and A. Brown, H. M. Evans in 1913

300, for a combined total of 600. The population of Toronto was approaching 300,000 in 1900.¹¹³ The conservative cause seemed to be mortally wounded: James Beaty Sr died in 1892; the *Bible Index* ceased publication in 1893; Robert Beaty died in 1896, and James Beaty Jr in 1898. The progressive cause at Cecil St. and Keele St. was accelerating. The story of the Restoration churches in Toronto in the 20th century is one of widening divergence.

It is appropriate at this point to consider several assessments.¹¹⁴ (1) Early differences were present in the two groups and these continued latent, all but unremembered, yet having a conditioning impact upon unfolding developments and contributing to the final separation.¹¹⁵ (2) Early break-through insights were not sufficiently capitalized upon subsequently by either group.¹¹⁶ (3) Early pragmatic responses hardened to become dogmatic necessities.¹¹⁷ (4) Controversy produced in-the-

¹¹³ Toronto reached 300,000 in 1908.

¹¹⁴ There is always some presumption attached to judging the events and movements of the past. Even the best of records touch on only a small portion of the original reality. The student of history does not have a divine gift of total reconstruction. Most of the records are in themselves judgments passed on by others. Current “assessments” are the means by which the writer inserts his or her own personal biases. However, as limiting as these truths are, the chief reason for studying the past is to bring commentary to the present. Judgments regarding the past are necessary, but they must be cautiously made and cautiously considered.

¹¹⁵ The reform movement in North America derived initially from the secessionist disruptions in Scotland. While strongly anti-clerical, the model for “church” remained largely Presbyterian, and this uncritically received. The “conservatives,” rejecting the ordained pastor order, nevertheless saw the church as primarily a worshipping society—under a plurality of elders—rather than as an agent of redemption in which evangelism is primary. Thus, it was natural for them to maintain the “keeping house for the Lord” mode. On the other hand, while widely touted as “Scotch Baptists,” the Scots of the Eramosa church connection, with whom T. C. Scott was comfortable, were in fact rooted in the Scottish Baptists of the English Baptist order. Thus, their persistent push for the co-operative enterprise and, latterly, for the trained one-man pastor leader, was in keeping with their roots. As well, the role of the evangelist receded before the growing emphasis upon the pastor in the system.

¹¹⁶ The two nuggets of gold in the discoveries of the early Restoration were (1) the recognition that the clergy-laity system was a fraud and injurious to the Christian system in the extreme, and, related, (2) the local church was God’s agent for spreading the redemption story. But these visions dimmed and ultimately almost disappeared during the three-quarter century of our study. Neither group truly appreciated the eldership as men responsible for leading the membership into full-fledged ministry. The conservatives were dominated by strong, single leaders (informal one-man pastors!). The progressives ultimately opted for the professional, one-man pastor and subjected the churches to boards of management. Neither group seemed to elevate the congregation to the high place that God intends for his servants. The conservatives spoke of the all-sufficiency of the congregation but failed to put wheels under their concept. The progressives ran after the multiple associations of the day that were superimposed on the life of the church, e.g. union Sunday schools, young peoples endeavor societies, Bible unions, women’s mission societies, the national missionary society, etc.

¹¹⁷ Practical conditions in the pioneer period, while society was virtually cashless, required that evangelists had first to be farmers, “sowing” the gospel in between land clearing, seeding, haying, and harvesting. Collaboration was needed between congregations if an evangelist were to be available for fulltime work. The early “co-operation” between churches was a practical answer to that need. That time passed, however; rural and urban Ontario prospered. Individual churches or a small cluster of congregations in a region could well have supported an evangelist(s). Proponents of “the arrangement,” however, became increasingly enamored with the machinery, and, in the name of vigorous evangelism, advanced the central board. In the end, predictably, it was deciding major matters for the church at large. The same could be said for the conservatives’ commitment to “mutual ministry.” That leading men might edify the brethren in voluntary service was entirely appropriate in the beginning. “Mutual ministry,” however, became a doctrinaire matter, an item of faith in the practice of the local church utilizing the system.

box thinking that deafened each side to the other's statements and in the end moved to extremism.¹¹⁸

The conservative group, nevertheless, burst into the 20th century with a new location and a new vision, at the Bathurst Street location.¹¹⁹ With the effective preaching of William D. Campbell¹²⁰ for the previous two years at the Brunswick Hall location, membership had grown to 225.¹²¹ This congregation with new energy moved to new facilities on Nov. 2, 1902 on Bathurst St. just north of College St.¹²² Campbell served for the next two years and returned a number of times for special meetings.¹²³ A. C. Jackson commuted from Detroit to preach at Bathurst twice on Sunday for a time.¹²⁴ The elders in 1907 included William Forrester, Duncan Stirling and John Smart.¹²⁵ Visiting evangelists over the years included: James A. Harding, T. B. Larimore,¹²⁶ Fred Sommer, and C. D.

¹¹⁸ The forming division between the "progressives" and the "conservatives" in Toronto, as well as in the province, is a classic example of how controversy stiffens the position of each party, leads to the inability to hear what each other is saying, and contributes to extremism on both sides. On the one hand, those who sensed strongly the impropriety of professionals being elevated to a clergy level within the churches, focused on "payment" (i.e. of the located preacher/pastor) as the chief problem, rather than seeing the supported evangelist, located or itinerating, as the desired agent of an outreaching congregation. On the other hand, those who promoted the located minister did not hear the concerns of their counterparts, that this arrangement diminished the eldership and pointed the churches back to the sectarian arrangement from which they had come. Raging controversy ultimately captures opposing thought in an ironclad box of intolerance. The Toronto/Ontario division, forming like a tropical storm in the ocean that strengthens to develop into a full-fledged hurricane, reached its nadir when the editor of the *Worker* and the former editor of the *Index*, from their respective papers, in 1883 streamed virulent invective against each other. Extreme positions were reached: by James Beatty Jr of the conservatives who denied the place of the evangelist in the modern church on the proposition that in the NT evangelists were Holy Spirit inspired men, an arrangement that concluded with the NT; and by the provincial Co-operation of the progressives that moved into a management position for the churches by actually initiating, on behalf of the churches, the possibility of union with the Christian Connection. (This was in addition to deciding that local preaching should be by paid pasturing rather than by mutual ministry, determining regional strategy regarding church plantings, and operating its own periodical as a "voice" for the churches.)

¹¹⁹ Butchart maintains that Bathurst was a direct continuation of the original Beatty group by way of Shuter and Louisa. Butchart, 531. In fact, the Brunswick congregation found its beginning in those who broke away from the Denison Ave. church in 1889. Their spirit was the same as that of Louisa St., however. Rushford observes that "the remnant from Louisa St. had been meeting for several years in the east end of Toronto." *Gospel Herald*, July 1998, 8-9.

¹²⁰ William "Willie" D. Campbell, was an Ontario boy that developed into an effective evangelist who gained a reputation throughout the province and in Detroit, at Plum St., where he served both before and after his Toronto work, 1900-1904.

¹²¹ Myrna Perry supplied this note: "Brother W. Campbell of the Plum Street Church, Detroit, Mich., commenced a meeting for the brethren worshiping on Brunswick avenue, in the city of Toronto, Monday, October 17. He is sure to have a good meeting, as he is one of the most successful evangelists that Canada has produced." *Gospel Advocate*, Nov. 10, 1898, 723.

¹²² Adjoining the King Edward School grounds, the Bathurst building cost \$2,500 to construct. The architect was W. G. Malcolmson, Detroit. One innovation was a kitchen in the building and eating space that served 130 people at one sitting at a June meeting. *Bible Student*, 4, 6 (June, 1907), 7-8.

¹²³ An example of the conservatives accepting the concept of a located evangelist. He was present for the second anniversary meeting. He conducted a meeting in 1911 and baptized six. *Bible Student*, 8, 11 (Nov. 1911), 4.

¹²⁴ He traveled by train Saturday and Sunday nights. *Bible Student*, 4, 7 (Jul. 1907), 8. He died Sept. 24, 1908. 5, 11 (Nov. 1908), 8.

¹²⁵ *Ibid.*

¹²⁶ From Nashville, on Sept. 27, 1907. 4, 9 (Sept. 1907), 8. His meeting lasted from Sept. 29 to Oct. 13. It was also reported that he visited Wychwood Park and East Toronto. *Bible Student*, 4, 10 (Oct. 1907), 8.

Crouch, Alex. Stewart, G. A. Klingman, Henry McKerlie, and Fred Cowin (who arrived from England in 1908) worked for longer periods in evangelism in association with the Bathurst church.¹²⁷ The Bathurst St. congregation hosted a June Meeting in 1907 and used the occasion to share their vision.¹²⁸ The Bathurst church elders offered to take on a leading role in a “co-operative” effort for the “loyal brethren.”¹²⁹ The initiative was discussed at the Saturday evening gathering and again at a Monday “ways and means” discussion. The people present seemed generally in favour of the initiative.¹³⁰ It appears that some co-operative arrangement was made in July with churches in St. Catharines, Jordan, Smithville, Tintern, and Hamilton.¹³¹ However, the brethren at large, once burned, seemed suspicious and were largely non-responsive to the initiative, and it died.¹³² The Bathurst congregation, in fact, was a center of influence and energy for the conservatives for a number of years.¹³³ In time the complexion of the neighborhood changed, and

¹²⁷ Ibid. Eighteen were baptized in the first eight months of his work. 6, 3 (Mar. 1909), 8.

¹²⁸ George Collins, England, spoke in the morning and A. C. Jackson in the evening. On the Saturday evening previous, two young preachers from the Peninsula spoke, O. H. Tallman of Smithville and D. H. Jackson of Jordan.

¹²⁹ The label “loyal brethren” was widely used to identify those that rejected the innovations. H. M. Evans reported that in 1905 in Canada there were only about thirty “loyal congregations,” most numerically weak, and “possibly a dozen evangelists in this vast field.” *Bible Student*, 2, 6 (June 1905), 1.

¹³⁰ The Bathurst brethren agreed to continue the co-operative venture maintained between them and the Meaford church in support Neal, Petch, and Whitfield in the field. Their proposal: “The Bathurst St. brethren have decided to ask the Churches of Christ all over Canada to assist them in creating and maintaining a fund for the support of these brethren in destitute fields and to place other men in the field as soon as possible. . . . It seemed generally agreed that just as the church at Jerusalem was made the centre from which distribution should be made to needy brethren (Acts 11:29, 30) so should the church at Bathurst St be made the base of supplies from which to distribution should be made through its elders and deacons to each evangelist in his respective work. . . . The church is the Lord’s Society and the formation of any other casts a serious reflection upon the wisdom of heaven.” *Bible Student*, 4, 6 (June 1907), 4. In fact, Bathurst was proposing “the sponsoring church” arrangement that was generally adopted by Churches of Christ in the mid-1900s.

¹³¹ It was decided to commence “the larger work immediately, and as a beginning have arranged with Bro. S. Whitfield of Wardsville” to enter fulltime work. *Bible Student*, 4, 7 (July 1907), 8.

¹³² H. M. Evans, in a *Bible Student* editorial, “Co-operation,” wrote: “Some objections have been made, we understand, to the action by the Bathurst congregation at our Annual Meeting, regarding the co-operation of churches and individuals. . . . in spreading the gospel. . . . the fear seems to be in the possibility of the ‘centralization.’” The idea of a “committee” was rejected by the Bathurst elders. “It is neither the intention nor the desire of the Bathurst brethren to monopolize the rights and privileges of individual congregations.” The editor commented: “There is neither ‘committee,’ ‘society,’ nor ‘board’ controlling this affair, that it is purely *the church* through its elders [acting]. . . . Don’t be an ‘anti.’” 4, 9 (Sept. 1907), 4. Later, the editor reported on “Misrepresentations”: “Charges of a conspiracy between Bathurst and the *Bible Student* to control the churches and centralize power in the hands of a few men and to make the Annual Meeting an executive body to legislate for and control the church. . . . These seem to be misrepresentations by jealous and vicious spirits.” (It was also reported that the fund had received a total of \$37.85.) *Bible Student*, 4, 11 (Nov. 1907), 4. Then in March, 1908, of the *Student*, this letter from the Bathurst elders to the editor appeared: “The response to the invitation has not been general, only a few churches have intimated there (sic) willingness to work along the lines indicated. . . . a better acquaintance with the teaching of the Scripture. . . . may warrant us, or others, in renewing the appeal with more success” (5, 3, 5).

¹³³ An interesting meeting took place at Bathurst in 1921, the year that the “Hillcrest” church formed. The progressive churches held a conference in Guelph on Oct. 28 that considered a proposal to establish a co-ordinating arrangement for the churches that would be nation wide, to be called the “All-Canada” program. Teams were sent out to visit the churches across the country to explain the plan. One such meeting was conducted at Bathurst—on Thanksgiving Day, “intended to be representative for all the Toronto churches.” Butchart recalls, “it was inspiring and suggestive” (177).

Bathurst sold its building to a Jewish group in 1942, relocating to Bayview Ave. at Soudan Ave. just south of Eglinton Ave. in 1943.¹³⁴ As this was in the midst of the war years, only a basement auditorium could be constructed at first.

The Bathurst congregation in the same year (1907) planted “the banner of the cross on the hill north of the city” in Wychwood Park village, and the second “Wychwood” congregation came into being.¹³⁵ Initially, it was called the Vaughan Road Church of Christ, as it was located at Vaughan Rd. and Alice Ave. In March of 1907, some 18 members “hived off” from Bathurst to form this new church; “scarcity of houses in the city led a few of the members...to locate in Wychwood.” The people living nearby were in “shacks and shanties.” The leaders were W. A. Stephenson, John Sim and A. E. Hudson. Meetings were conducted in Stephenson’s home until the building was completed. The opening service was held on May 5, 1907 with membership standing at 30. William Forester spoke at the Table, supported by Duncan Stirling and Bro. Standish. By July the number had grown to 35. By the third anniversary, the membership stood at 70.¹³⁶ Over the years, migration to the West, totaling over 200 by the 1920s, cut into the membership of this group.¹³⁷ In 1926 a veneer of brick was added to the frame building, and, with a name change for Alice St., the Wychwood Park church became the Maplewood Church of Christ.¹³⁸

The second congregation to be formed by Bathurst members was located at Fern Ave. and Sorauren Ave. in the Parkdale area. J. H. Ablett and R. L. Walker were those who led some 30 willing members in the church planting. The opening of the new work was on May 1, 1910. Forty-two members transferred from Bathurst in the first year. The property selected cost \$3,500 for which almost \$2,000 was supplied by members and congregational funds from Bathurst.¹³⁹ Albert Brown, of England, had been invited by the

¹³⁴ Leading men at the time of the move included J. Noad, Thos. Galbraith, A. J. Grainger, A. B. Herron, Wm. G. Hammond, Fred R. Smart, J. Patterson (sec.), and A. J. Trusler (treas.). Butchart, 522. The Sept. 1944 *Gospel Herald* listed Bayview at Soudan: T. L. Rowlett, evangelist; Louis B. Greer, secretary. Butchart, 271.

¹³⁵ (The “progressives” opened their Wychwood Church of Christ 10 years earlier, 1/2 mile away.) “Approval and hearty cooperation of the Bathurst Church of Christ, Toronto: It has been decided to form a new congregation in this district and to build a small meeting house...” The land cost \$550 and the building about \$800. Money could be sent to W. A. Stephenson, Wychwood Park. A “Restrictive Clause” (re instrumental music) was inserted into the deed. *Bible Student*, 4, 1 (Jan. 1907), 3.

¹³⁶ *Bible Student*, 4, 6 (June, 1907), 10; 4, 7 (July 1907), 5; 4, 8 (Aug. 1907), 3, 7; 7, 6 (June 1910), 7.

¹³⁷ See Jerry Rushford, “A Forgotten History,” *Gospel Herald*, 63, 1 (July 1998), 8, 9; for a history of the Wychwood church that became the Maplewood church. With respect to “forgotten churches,” Wychwood Park was one church Reuben Butchart overlooked in his generally thoroughgoing study.

¹³⁸ Handwritten notes, “Maplewood History,” by Ina Bennetts. (The earlier Alice St. location in downtown Toronto no longer exists, perhaps absorbed by the Eaton Center.)

¹³⁹ An offer of purchase of a Presbyterian Church building that was to be vacated in March or April 1910 had been made by the Bathurst group in the latter part of 1909. *Bible Student*, 6, 12 (Dec. 1909), 7. The finances of the day give some perspective. The 1909 income for Bathurst was \$2,533.76. \$465 of this was applied, principal and interest, to its own mortgage of \$2,700. The members raised \$1,750 for the new work and \$200 was taken out of the treasury, for a total of \$1,950. “The Elm St. congregation loaned \$1,955.91” to be interest free until Feb. 1912. An unnamed brother from Bathurst loaned the final \$500 so that a mortgage was not necessary for the Fern Ave. church. *Bible Student*, 7, 6 (June 1910), 7.

The indication is that the Elm St. disbanded in mid-1905. It is surmised that the former “New Jerusalem” church building had been purchased by Elm St., and then sold, with the trustees holding the proceeds until an appropriate use of the funds could be found. According to Rushford, “Several additional members from Bathurst as well as the remnant from Louisa St. had been meeting for several years in the east end of

Bathurst church to work with Fred Cowin as evangelists in the city. Brother Brown arrived on the opening day at Fern Ave., May 1. By the end of 1910, 100 were enrolled in Bible school. In one year the membership had grown to 89, and by 1913 to 125, with 200 in the Bible school.¹⁴⁰ A 1935 silver anniversary record identified as leaders: A. L. Whitelaw, Sydney Huntsman, Partington, Smallwood, Walker, and Daniel Yake. The list of those who preached included, Albert Brown, D. H. Jackson, W. C. Macdougall, W. G. Charlton, H. McKerlie, and C. G. Vincent.¹⁴¹

It is now time to return to the Cecil St. congregation that was flourishing and so optimistic at the turn of the century. In January 11, 1921, an agreement was reached to merge the mother and daughter congregations, Cecil St. and the Wychwood church. Together, they numbered 313 members. The decision was made to construct a new building on the site of the Wychwood church at Vaughan Rd. and Helena Ave. and to sell the Cecil St. property.¹⁴² While the new building was being constructed, the congregations met as usual for a time, and then came together, meeting for a year in the auditorium of a St. Claire Ave. theatre. On January 21, 1923, the new building was dedicated. The minister at the time was R. George Quiggin who served until 1930.¹⁴³ The name, "Hillcrest," was a local description of the high land in the area.¹⁴⁴ Finally, gaining a "building believed to be the most ornate and costly building we have in Canada," the progressives had achieved parity with the modern churches in the city, with an imposing cathedral, a "sanctuary," choir stall and organ, and ordained ministers serving.¹⁴⁵ In twenty years (by 1941) membership had grown to 500.¹⁴⁶

A second early 1920s development in the city was the establishment of the Strathmore Blvd. congregation by the conservative brethren. Ralph Schell,¹⁴⁷ preacher with the Main St. congregation encouraged this undertaking and held tent meetings near the site where the meetinghouse was being built at Coxwell Ave. and Strathmore Blvd. The work opened in June 1924 with 34 members from Main St. forming the nucleus. The connection with the Shuter St./Louisa St./Bathurst St. brethren was tangibly expressed by the inclusion on the front of the structure of the stone inscription that had been on the brick building at Shuter St.: "If ye continue in my word, then are ye my disciples indeed" (John 8:31).¹⁴⁸ D. H. Jackson followed Schell as evangelist. Butchart lists the evangelists

Toronto." *Gospel Herald*, July 1998, 9. This might imply that these were the holders of the trust and actually became part of the new work at Fern, thus eager to supply financial assistance.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid.

¹⁴¹ Butchart, 532-3.

¹⁴² Cecil St. was valued at \$35,000 but sold for only \$20,000 (537).

¹⁴³ Other ministers who served this church: Rhodes Thompson, 1931-34; C. Andrew Lawson, 1936-1942; Hugh Kilgour, 1943-1947; and Neil Crawford, 1948 (537).

¹⁴⁴ Ibid., 533.

¹⁴⁵ C. Andrew Lawson created a "new fellowship," beginning in 1940, cooperating in a pre-Easter week of evening meetings and a Good Friday morning communion service with the Salvation Army, two United Churches, St. Clair Baptist, St. Clair Presbyterian, St. Michaels, and All Angels Anglican. Butchart, 537.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., 539.

¹⁴⁷ Ralph Schell's family pioneered in Vaughan Township, arriving from New York State around 1805. "Tragedy struck the Schell descendents when during 1900 five children from one family died of diphtheria within a few months. Ralph was the only surviving son. He began to preach at age 16...He went to Chicago and other points in the United States continuing his ministry for many years." *Churches of Vaughan Township*, 138.

¹⁴⁸ The stone engravings languished in a construction yard following the razing of the Shuter St. building (ca. 1915). They were purchased by Benjamin Kirk, elder at Hillcrest, and presented as a gift to the

up to 1944: M. Watterworth (following Jackson), Earl C. Smith, K. Spaulding, Madison Wright, Wallace Cauble (1928-33), W. G. Charlton, Raymond Crumbliss (1943), and Charles Lemmons (1944).¹⁴⁹ In 1949 there were about 125 members. Currently the membership stands at about 230.

The two church plantings from Bathurst, Maplewood and Fern Ave. were each responsible for beginning a new church, Concord and Harding Ave., respectively. Members from Maplewood began the new effort in Vaughan Township in about 1961. Meetings were held concurrently in the Concord Public School and the Witty farm, then for about a year in Bert Atkinson's garage before the Concord church building was completed in 1963. The first meeting in that building was in September. This work continued until 1994 when a declining membership resulted in the sale of the building and the disbanding of the church.¹⁵⁰ Members from Fern Ave. established the Harding Ave. congregation in 1955. Joseph A. Grainger and his son, Elmer A. Grainger took the lead. For the first year, the group rented Keelesdale Hall on Bicknell Ave. The Harding Ave. building was purchased in 1956.¹⁵¹ Harding Ave. continues today and has about 50 members.

In 1965 the Maplewood group merged with the Fern Ave. congregation to become the West Toronto Church of Christ.¹⁵² As hopefully the first step in realizing a vision upheld by Blenus Wright of one vital church in the city of Toronto,¹⁵³ the merger attracted the effort of "Exodus Toronto." Led by Canadian George Snure, whose recent ministry had been in Memphis, TN, this group of four families arrived in 1967 determined to advance the cause in the burgeoning city. However, the combined difficulties of melding two distinct church personalities and of absorbing the accelerated goals of the evangelistic team were too great for the group and dissolution followed. In

Strathmore church. Butchart, 504.

¹⁴⁹ Some of the leaders in the mid-1900s included Herbert Dale, Munden Peddle, Grant Stevenson, Shepherd Tallman, and C. Warren. The church did not depend upon a "preacher" but worked with their evangelists, in turn generating a dozen young men to go forth as evangelists. The congregation was interested in missions as well, supporting a work at Charlton Station near Kirkland Lake and at Farmborough, PQ. Butchart, 530-531.

¹⁵⁰ The first meetings at Concord were held in about 1961 Sunday evenings at the Concord Public School. The work began with Maplewood members, Bro. Robertson, Joe and Doris Kippax, Roy and Ann Witty, and Don Perry, with the help of Brother Rockcliffe from the US, going door-to-door. Later Bob and Elsie Slater from Bayview lent considerable support. After about a year, Bert Atkinson, having moved a bungalow to the Concord Rd. location (51 Concord Rd.), added a garage, and the group met there up until the opening of the building (23 Concord Rd) in 1963. (A lengthy delay in building was due to the resistance of the Vaughan council to give a building permit. This was in spite of the terms of agreement for the sale of the Cooper farm upon which the church building would be located, that stipulated a lot to be available for a church, but none for commercial purposes.) Leading members of the Concord church at the time of opening were: Bert and Loretta Atkinson, Joe and Doris Kippax, Bill and Bea Thompason, Bert and Marion Witty, Roy and Ann Witty, and Agnes Young. The contractor for the brick building was Michael Bachuk, Hamilton, who was engaged in building the Barrie church building at the same time. (Other church buildings constructed by Bachuk were Fennell Ave. in Hamilton and the Niagara Falls meeting house on Dorchester Rd.) As reported by Joe Kippax and Roy Witty.

¹⁵¹ Leading in the early years at Harding Ave. included the Graingers, Leonard Cannon, Bob McLeod, Wes Anning and Orville Clint. As reported by George Grainger.

¹⁵² The elders serving the new congregation were Albert Bennetts, Colin Cameron Sr, John MacKay, and Bro. Kennedy.

¹⁵³ Cf. an arresting booth identifying the church and its work was placed in the Canadian National Exhibition for several years.

1968 a group left to form the Etobicoke church that met in the YMCA. And in 1973, that group dissolved with a number reforming in the east end of Toronto as the Metro East congregation, meeting at 7 Elinor Ave., at the Wexford Presbyterian Church. Metro East disbanded in early 2001. In the meantime, the West Toronto church carried on until the Fern Ave. building was sold in 1972. For the next three years, the group met in the Fern Ave. Public School. Nov. 30, 1975 was the date of the last meeting of this church.¹⁵⁴ Several moved their membership to Bayview and others to the new work in Bramalea that had begun in 1969 (their building opening in 1976).

A church planting by members from the Strathmore Blvd. congregation in Scarborough took place on May 4 2003. Leading the effort were Devon and Sylvester Bennett and Steve Chubry. Devon continues as the evangelist. Meetings are held in the Scarborough YMCA, at 230 Town Centre Court.¹⁵⁵

An effort in Toronto by those brethren in the province who prefer to be identified as “non-institutional” was begun in 1998. Chuck Bartlett, a Canadian who had worked with the Jordan Church of Christ since 1992, moved to Toronto in that year and joined forces with David Dann who arrived from Georgia. Beginning with a handful of members, the group had reached about 40 in 2002. In February of that year, these evangelists opened a second work in the east end, in response to the number of converts as well as members living in that area. Presently, the West End church, served by David Dann, meets at 408 Royal York Rd, Suite #104, Etobicoke and numbers about 20 members. The East End church, served by Chuck Bartlett and Kerry Keenan (arriving from Tampa, Florida in August 2004), meets at 3601 Victoria Park Ave., Suite 206, in Scarborough and numbers about 35.¹⁵⁶

The International Church of Christ formed a congregation in Toronto in 1984 as an initiative of the Boston movement. Viewing its activity as the true Restorationist effort, it quickly distanced itself from Churches of Christ in Canada. The story of that effort has not been factored into this account. However, as changes have come recently within that fellowship, the possibility exists of a repositioning with respect to its relationship with churches of Christ across Canada. The future beckons with its opportunities.

The two groups in Toronto of the 19th century, the “conservatives” and the “progressives,” experienced a growing strain in their relationship with each other as the century advanced. The 20th century, with firm differences in conviction surfacing, saw the formation of three separate communities, the Disciples, the Christian Church, and Churches of Christ. In the 21st century, those of a Restorationist conviction continue to be challenged by its commitment to both truth and unity. Today in Toronto, there are now five groups espousing loyalty to the basic premise: respect for the Word of God as the sole basis for faith and practice.

¹⁵⁴ “After ten years of striving.” The Maplewood building had been sold in 1967. The membership in 1975 was down to about 40 and one-half of these were not willing to move to a location farther west. As reported by Bob Hunter. Ina Bennetts recalls those final days: “An effort was made several times to find a location in the west end of the city (re dwindling numbers). Even the revenues from selling both buildings did not meet the cost of the property that was available.” A hand-written note by Ina Bennetts.

¹⁵⁵ The Scarborough congregation hosted a major effort in evangelism July 11-18, 2004 at the Scarborough Civic Centre. Three speakers were engaged from California, Joe Pitts, Sammy Jones and Albert Regis, and Earl Greene from Newark, NY. As reported by Devon Bennett.

¹⁵⁶ In July 2002 Bruce Hall moved to Toronto from Athens, Alabama in order to work fulltime with the East End congregation. He tragically passed away in June 2003. As reported by David Dann.

In all, brethren have met in 40 different locations in Toronto over the period. A direct line links Bayview Ave. with Shuter St. and Hillcrest with Richmond St. Two churches came into existence independently.¹⁵⁷ Sixteen churches were formed as intentional church plantings.¹⁵⁸ Four new groups may have started possibly because of tension in the previous group.¹⁵⁹ Four mergers occurred, three successful, one not successful.¹⁶⁰ Only one group came into existence because of a specific division.¹⁶¹ Ten congregations have disbanded.¹⁶² One reunion occurred and lasted one year.¹⁶³ Of the twenty-four distinct congregations that emerged, ten remain.¹⁶⁴

It is 183 years since James Beaty was putting down his roots in Toronto in 1821, including his independent examination of his own spiritual condition. There were about 500 citizens then. In 2001 there were 2,481,494 people in Metropolitan Toronto and 4,682,987 in the Greater Toronto Area. The nine of the ten churches mentioned as remaining in the previous paragraph, combined, do not presently total 1,000 members. The statistics are not kind. *Toronto Life 2000*¹⁶⁵ predicted that by 2021 there would be 6.4 million people living in Toronto. Those of a Restorationist conviction in reviewing the past, will be both sobered and educated as well as both motivated and renewed for the work ahead.

Nevertheless, the examination of a movement that touches three centuries in Toronto, that has survived not because of the bolstering support of national or international mechanisms but because of the determination and aspirations of ordinary people, and that continues because of the conviction that its cause is noble, is truly a humbling experience. Large cities are bastions of materialism where overwhelming influences of worldliness batter little churches. The apostle Paul spoke of "...the perils in the city" (2 Cor. 11:27). That a beacon of light still beams from Toronto is a tribute to the believers' faith and faithfulness. And today, leadership for the brotherhood in the province and the nation does radiate from Toronto. This year, Strathmore Blvd. gives thanks for its 80th year. This congregation is unique, possibly world wide, in that it identifies currently some 32 nationalities in its membership, reflecting the multicultural makeup of modern Toronto. In recent years it coordinated the "Good News is for Sharing" effort to place Christian literature in every home in Canada, and today it continues to coordinate the nation-wide "Key to the Kingdom" TV broadcast. And its evangelist and one of its elders publish the *Gospel Herald*, a 68 year-old periodical that is

¹⁵⁷ The group meeting in James Armstrong's home; East Toronto.

¹⁵⁸ Wychwood and Central by Cecil St.; Keele St. by Denison Ave.; Russell Rd., North Ave. Rd., 222 Broadway, Westway, and Willowdale by Keele St.; Wychwood Park and Fern Ave. by Bathurst St.; Strathmore Blvd. by Main St.; Harding Ave. by Fern Ave.; Concord by Maplewood; East End by West End; Scarborough by Strathmore Blvd.; the Toronto ICOC church by the Boston movement.

¹⁵⁹ Richmond St., Albert Hall, Etobicoke, and Metro East.

¹⁶⁰ Brunswick Ave. with Bathurst St.; Wychwood with Cecil St; Broadway with Bayview. Fern Ave. and Maplewood.

¹⁶¹ Spadina Ave.

¹⁶² Pembroke St., Elm St., Central, West Toronto, Etobicoke, Metro East, Russell Rd., North Ave. Rd. Willowdale, and Concord.

¹⁶³ Richmond St. and Shuter St.

¹⁶⁴ Bayview Ave., Hillcrest, Strathmore Blvd., Keele St., Westway, Harding Ave., Scarborough, West End, East End, Toronto ICOC.

¹⁶⁵ *Toronto Life 2000*, 84-90.

read across Canada. It is with great hope that in 2021—with fully 200 years of witnessing—the Lord will still find us faithful.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Reuben Butchart was the first to write a comprehensive history of the Restoration churches in Toronto. A major portion of this study is drawn from his chronicles. A careful reading of Butchart will identify that rather than multiples of churches stung out across the city at various locations, there were two leading congregations that survived for about 100 years at the time of his writing and for over 150 years to the present time. These were located in a succession of halls and church buildings. In addition, there were the several split-offs, offshoots, and plantings. Butchart's copious record is available because of the helpful indexing of his book done by Claude Cox in 1992 and by Thomas Fountain and Rob Glenn in 1994. Butchart's work, in book form, is hard to come by, but an electronic copy is available on the Internet:

<http://www.mun.ca/rels/restmov/texts/rbutchart/dcc/DCC00H.HTM>.

Butchart, Reuben. *The Disciples of Christ in Canada Since 1830*. Toronto: Canadian Headquarters' Publications, 1949.

Speaking of the Internet, extensive and valuable information is available on the three Beatys who are prominent in the 1800s. The address: "The Descendents of Robert Beaty and Catherine Crawford": <http://www.islandregister.com/beaty.html>.

The book that contains the papers presented at five "Restoration Heritage Days" edited by Claude Cox, contains three articles helpful for this study: Thomas Fountain's "Toronto's Early Disciple Churches," Mary Ann Brown's "The History of the Keele St. Church of Christ, Toronto," and Steve May's "The Church of Christ at Omagh: a Restoration Miniature."

Cox, Claude, ed. *The Campbell-Stone Movement in Ontario: Christian Church (Disciples of Christ), Churches of Christ, Independent Christian Churches/Churches of Christ*. Queenston, ON: The Edwin Mellen Press, Ltd., 1995.

Eugene Perry's recently published thesis on the history of Canadian Restoration periodicals was a valuable source not only for the papers published and their editors but also for the historical backdrop to the developments in Canada that it outlines.

Perry, Eugene C. *A History of Religious Periodicals in the Restoration Movement in Canada*. Beamsville, ON: The Gospel Herald Foundation, 2003; an M.A. thesis presented to Pepperdine University, 1971.

The Restoration movement in Canada is well served by a collection of extant papers starting with David Oliphant Jr's *Witness of Truth* in 1845. I had direct access to papers that covered three extended periods in preparation of this record: (1) *The Christian Banner, Banner of the Faith, and Message of Good-Will to Men*, 1852-1865, (2) the *Bible Index*, 1873-1893, and (3) the *Bible Student*, 1904-1913. Yet these resources constitute only 25% of the periodical record available. This acknowledgement is meant to demonstrate that resources are abundant for ongoing studies of our Restoration past.

Jerry Rushford's 1998 article, "A Forgotten Chapter in Toronto Church History," was helpful in details brought together concerning the Wychwood Park Church of Christ that was renamed the Maplewood Church of Christ in 1926. This work illustrates that a person, with interest and determination, as far away as California, can access the historic data and remind present day disciples of valiant efforts in the past.

Rushford, Jerry. "A Forgotten Chapter in Toronto Church History." *Gospel Herald*. (July 1998): 8-9.

Bruce West, a long-time reporter and columnist for the *Globe and Mail* in the mid-1900s, wrote one of a number of books that tell the story of Toronto from the first visit to the area by a European, namely Etienne Brule in 1615, to the present. West's book provides a helpful insight into the growth and development of the city.

West, Bruce. *Toronto*. Toronto: Doubleday Canada Limited, 1979.

A number of people shared their recollections of various congregations and served in various ways and deserve to be thanked:

- Eugene Perry surveyed *The Witness of Truth* (1845-1850) and *The Christian Mirror* (1851) for reports of the work at Shuter St. and found none. Scott and/or Richmond St. are mentioned about a dozen times in these writings, including Scott's efforts both in Toronto and east and north of Toronto. Eugene was assisted by his sister, Myrna Perry who had earlier indexed these papers, making the search readily accessible.
- Joe Kippax and Roy Witty shared memories of Concord.
- Edythe Williams faxed hand-written recollections by her father and mother, Albert and Ina Bennetts concerning Maplewood and West Toronto. Margaret Whitelaw also reminisced. Bob Hunter was able to go to some church records for the details of the final years of West Toronto.
- Richard Kruse gave insights regarding West Toronto, Etobicoke, and Metro East and confirmed his facts with Bill MacKay and Audrey Wright. Audrey also shared her memories of Hedley Whitelaw's comments regarding Main St.
- Steve Rudd was helpful in directing me to David Dann regarding the recent West End and East End church plantings. David Dann was kind in giving a detailed account of the planting and development of these efforts.
- George Grainger recalled his early days as a 15 year-old at Harding Ave., a church planting from Fern Ave. accomplished by his grandfather and father.
- Max Craddock did a survey of the current membership of the churches in Toronto.
- Jim Dale used his computer skills in formatting the time-line of the Restoration churches in Toronto that appears in these notes.
- Bob and Marg Sandiford used their computer wizardry to reproduce the forty or so pictures of buildings and leaders in the early years for projection at the time of the lecture.
- Crystal Cook kindly made her laptop computer and projector available so that these pictures might be viewed.

Appreciation is expressed to the Canadian Churches of Christ Historical Society for the invitation to present this paper on the occasion of its 2004 annual meeting at Strathmore Blvd. Church of Christ. It is hoped that the extensive footnoting, some 60% of the study, will serve as an encouragement to others to believe that a rich lode of information does exist to support research and analysis in Canadian Restoration studies.

My early intention was to present Reflections on the Restoration Movement in Toronto. It soon became evident that such “Reflections” would require my laying a proper historical foundation. Then I realized that to do a History of the Restoration Movement in Toronto, for a period spanning almost 185 years, for a one-hour lecture, was impossible. Even the final plan, to give a basic account of the churches’ comings and goings—to supply a hoped-for structure for future studies by others—would tax the available time and the attention of my auditors! This presentation is put forth, as a fisherman casts his nets, in hopes that it might pull in both corrections and additional information, and as well archival materials for the historical society. There are conjectures advanced in the footnotes where the facts do not supply the full picture. These may or may not hold water. While a number helped out from their memories of past events, I am fully responsible for any and all inaccuracies.

Timeline: The Restoration Churches in Toronto

“Conservatives”

“Progressives”







